

# Philosophy and AI

5-12-2024

dr. Carlo Ierna

[c.ierna@vu.nl](mailto:c.ierna@vu.nl)

<http://ierna.name>

# What is AI?

“The central problem of AI is the question: *What is the letter ‘a’?* Donald Knuth, on hearing me make this claim once, appended, *‘And what is the letter “i”?’* –an amendment that I gladly accept.”  
Hofstadter (1985, p. 633)

# “Artificial Intelligence”

“Artificial”

VU

# Bananas

Kids and grown-ups love it so ...



... the happy world of Haribo!

Schuim met bananensmaak

**“Artificial”**

**Bananas are not used  
in the production of  
isoamylacetate**







# “Artificial”

1) Fake

2) Made by humans

“Intelligence”

“*Artificial Intelligence*”

Takes natural intelligence

as baseline:

humans are the standard

“making a machine behave in ways  
that would be called intelligent if  
a human were so behaving”  
(John McCarthy 1955)

“the science of making machines  
do things that would require  
intelligence if done by men”

(Marvin Minsky 1968)

“Intelligence”

“*Machine Intelligence*”

Not a question of real or fake:  
a different kind of intelligence

# “Intelligence”

- Problem solving?
- Pattern recognition?
- Information processing?

# “Intelligence”

- Knowledge?
- Intentionality?
- Consciousness?



# Alan Turing (1912-1954)



# Turing

## “Can Machines Think?”

Computing Machinery and Intelligence (1950)

# Turing

“I propose to consider the question, ‘Can machines think?’ This should begin with definitions of the meaning of the terms ‘machine’ and ‘think.’”

## Turing

“Instead of attempting such a definition I shall replace the question by another, which is closely related to it and is expressed in relatively unambiguous words.”

# Turing

“The original question  
‘Can machines think?’ I believe  
to be too meaningless to  
deserve discussion.”

# Turing

*Imitation game*  
“Turing Test”

# Turing

## *Imitation game*

If the machine fools us:  
is it intelligent?

**Machines actually do  
perform cognitive tasks**



**Machines actually do  
perform cognitive tasks  
some of which we couldn't do  
without their assistance**

**Computers and AI  
as cognitive tools  
replace human cognitive labor**

Computers and AI  
as cognitive tools  
enhance human cognitive labor

# Clark & Chalmers

## The Extended Mind

# Clark & Chalmers

Cognitive tools  
Symbolic technologies  
“the mind extends  
into the world”

# Clark & Chalmers

Does AI have a mind of its own,  
or does ours extend through it?

# Ethics

**If AI extends or replaces us,  
who's responsible?**

# Dissociation of technology and ethics

(Krämer 1992)



**Tools relieve us from:**

- 1) bodily labour**
- 2) mental labour**
- 3) responsibility**

**Technology changes  
human action  
into a process**

**Moral distance  
to the results  
of the process  
(alienation)**

In practice:  
We can solve problems,  
without understanding them

# Finding solutions independently from justifying solutions

# Division of labor with a machine: spreading responsibility and accountability

**Manufacturer, programmer,  
infrastructure, distributor,  
regulator, etc.**

# Are we in competition with AI?



**Workers against AI?**

**Workers with AI against  
workers without AI?**

How should we deal with this?

# William Fielding Ogburn (1922) “cultural lag”

products & innovations in  
“material culture”  
cause changes in  
“immaterial culture”

# Disruptive innovation

## “maladjustment”

“It is thinkable that the piling up of these cultural lags may reach such a point that they may be changed in a somewhat wholesale fashion. In such a case, the word revolution probably describes what happens.”

(Marshall 1999, p. 296)

# Technological breakthrough: a new worldview

Stone age,  
Bronze age,  
Iron age,  
etc.



age of the printing press,  
age of the steam engine,  
the atomic age,  
the computer age  
etc.

**Are our existing ethical theories,  
principles, values, policies, laws,  
etc. valid, and just need to be  
adjusted to the innovation?**

Or will our old immaterial culture likewise have to change radically due to the new material culture?

“A very large number of ethical principles, codes, guidelines, or frameworks have been proposed over the past few years. There are currently more than 70 recommendations, published in the last 2 years, just about the ethics of AI”

(Floridi 2019, p. 186)

**“Paniekvoetbal”**

**Ethics as brakes**

# Alternative: Ethics as steering wheel

“Instead of seeing ethics as some form of ‘assessment’, then, it should also be seen as the normative ‘guidance’ of technology in society. And at the same time, ethics can also guide society in dealing with technology.”

“The central question in guidance ethics is not ‘yes or no?’, but ‘how?’ It does not focus on rejecting or accepting, but on the valuable design, implementation and use of new technology.”

(Peter Paul Verbeek)



**Can we ethically justify  
the use of AI?**

**Division of labor and use of  
increasingly powerful tools  
have greatly increased  
our ability to act**

**The knife cuts both ways:  
how we use it, is up to us**