

Eternal Sovereigns

INDIGENOUS ARTISTS,
ACTIVISTS, AND TRAVELERS
REFRAMING ROME



Gloria Jane Bell

Eternal Sovereigns

BUY

DUKE

**UNIVERSITY
PRESS**

Eternal Sovereigns

INDIGENOUS ARTISTS,
ACTIVISTS, AND TRAVELERS
REFRAMING ROME

Gloria Jane Bell

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

Duke University Press · *Durham and London* · 2024

© 2024 Duke University Press All rights reserved
Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper ∞
Project Editor: Livia Tenzer
Designed by Courtney Leigh Richardson
Typeset in Garamond Premier Pro by Westchester Publishing Services

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Bell, Gloria Jane, [date] author.

Title: Eternal sovereigns : Indigenous artists, activists, and travelers
reframing Rome / Gloria Jane Bell.

Description: Durham : Duke University Press, 2024. | Includes
bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2023056173 (print)

LCCN 2023056174 (ebook)

ISBN 9781478030881 (paperback)

ISBN 9781478026617 (hardcover)

ISBN 9781478059844 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Catholic Church—Missions—North America. |
Esposizione missionaria vaticana (1924–1927 : Vatican City) | Indians
of North America—Material culture. | Indian art—North America. |
Museums—Acquisitions—Moral and ethical aspects. | Museums and
Indigenous peoples. | Ethnological museums and collections—Vatican
City. | Colonization—Religious aspects—Catholic Church.

Classification: LCC E98.M34 B45 2024 (print) | LCC E98.M34 (ebook) |

DDC 708.008997—dc23/eng/20240412

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023056173>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2023056174>

Cover art: Lakota Sioux, Sun Dance drawing, ca. 1875. Pigments on
muslin, 83 × 138 cm. Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*, Vatican
Museums, inv. no. 107323.

DUKE
UNIVERSITY
PRESS

For my family in the now and hereafter

DUKE

**UNIVERSITY
PRESS**

DUKE

**UNIVERSITY
PRESS**

Contents

List of Illustrations · ix

Acknowledgments · xv

Introduction

A NOMAD IN THE ROMAN ARCHIVES

Writing from the Margins · 1

I

UNSETTLING THE INDIAN MUSEUM IN ROME

Ferdinand Pettrich and Edmonia Wildfire Lewis · 23

2

“THE MOST EXHAUSTIVE RECORD OF THE
WORLD’S PROGRESS EVER DISPLAYED”

*Pope Pius XI’s Culture of Conquest and
Visitors’ Experiences at the Vatican Missionary Exposition* · 53

3

“A WINDOW ON THE WORLD” OF COLONIAL UNKNOWING

*Dioramas, Children’s Games, and Missionary
Perspectives at the Vatican Missionary Exposition* · 91

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

ETERNAL SOVEREIGNS AND ANCESTRAL ART
Ancient Archives, Relatives, and Travelers at the Vatican
Missionary Exposition • 125

Epilogue
 DEUS EX MACHINA
An Indigenous Protester at the Vatican
Missionary Exposition • 159

Appendix. Letters on Accessing the Vatican Missionary
 Ethnological Museum • 167
 Notes • 171
 Bibliography • 207
 Index • 231

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
 PRESS

Illustrations

Figures

I.1. • 3

Installation of miniature canoes from Turtle Island at the entrance of the Vatican Museums, Vatican City, May 2023.

I.2. • 3

Installation view, sculptures by Ferdinand Pettrich, Vatican Missionary Ethnological Museum, Vatican Museums, Vatican City, April 2016.

I.1. • 32

Ferdinand Pettrich, *Dying Tecumseh*, 1856. Marble. Smithsonian American Art Museum, Washington, DC.

I.2. • 43

Edmonia Lewis, *Minnehaha*, 1868. Marble. Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York.

2.1. • 56

“Il lavoro di sistemazione della mostra” (The work of setting up the show), 1924. Photograph.

2.2. • 64

Map of the Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925.

2.3. • 68

Borneo mission stand, Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

2.4. · 69

Uganda mission stand, Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

2.5. · 70

Map of the Hall of North America, Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925.

2.6. · 71

Hall of North America, Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

2.7. · 73

Sixteen busts of Native Americans by Ferdinand Pettrich displayed above Diné textiles, Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

2.8. · 74

Ferdinand Pettrich, *Sauk-Fox Woman*, ca. 1837. Drawing. Newberry Library, Chicago.

2.9. · 75

Ferdinand Pettrich, *A Band of Sioux Musicians*, ca. 1837. Drawing. Newberry Library, Chicago.

2.10. · 76

Ferdinand Pettrich, *The Sauk-Fox and Sioux Nations of the Mississippi Engaged in a War Dance*, ca. 1856. Bas-relief in gesso. Vatican Museums, Vatican City.

2.11. · 86

“Norme circa gli oggetti destinati all’esposizione” (Norms for objects destined for the exposition), 1923. Papal document.

2.12. · 88

Cover of *Rivista Illustrata della Esposizione Missionaria Vaticana*, 1924.

3.1. · 95

“The lady visitors admire the texture of some eastern cloth,” Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

3.2. · 101

“A missionary teaching Araucanian Indians,” Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

3.3. · 102

“Models of a native hut and Aborigines of Ecuador,” Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

x · ILLUSTRATIONS

3.4. • 103

Architecture of violence, 2023. Photograph with lettering by the author.

3.5. • 104

Hall of North America, Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

3.6. • 105

A corner of the Hall of South America, Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

3.7. • 106

Hall of South America, Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

3.8. • 114

Letter by Florentin Digmann SJ with photograph of Očhéthi Šakówin children, *Indian Sentinel*, May 23, 1925.

3.9. • 121

Certificate of participation in the Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925.

4.1. • 129

Statue of Father J. Marquette, Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

4.2. • 137

Passamaquoddy, Christ on cross, ca. 1830. Wood with pigment. Vatican Museums, Vatican City.

4.3. • 138

Installation view, Passamaquoddy, Christ on cross, Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*, Vatican Museums, Vatican City, March 2023.

4.4. • 144

Lakota Sioux, Sun Dance drawing, ca. 1875. Pigments on muslin. Vatican Museums, Vatican City.

E.1. • 161

Sacred Hearts missionary with cultural belongings from Oceania, Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925. Photograph.

E.2. • 162

Leaflet distributed by Anthony Martin Fernando at the entrance to the Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925.

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

ILLUSTRATIONS • xi

Plates

1.

Anno Santo 1925, Pius XI, Pont. Max. (Holy Year 1925, Pius XI, Pope).
Commemorative card.

2.

Approaching via della Conciliazione, ache in chest, 2023. Photograph with
lettering by the author.

3.

Edmonia Lewis's *carte de visite* featuring a photograph of her by Fratelli
D'Alessandri, Rome, ca. 1874–76.

4.

Ticket for the Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925.

5.

Six scenes from the opening of the 1925 Vatican Missionary Exposition, 1925.
Commemorative cards.

6.

Maurizio Rava, *Anno Santo MCMXXV, Esposizione Missionaria
Vaticana* (Holy Year 1925, Vatican Missionary Exposition), 1925. Poster.

7.

Viaggi missionari (Missionary voyages), board game, ca. 1930.

8.

Il giuoco del missionario (The missionary game), board game, ca. 1930.

9.

View of Saint Peter's from the Propaganda Fide College, Janiculum Hill,
Rome, 2017. Photograph.

10.

Marquette move out of the way, 2023. Photograph with lettering by the author.

11.

Anishinaabe, Nipissing, and Kanien'kehá:ka, wampum belt, ca. 1830. Deer
hide, shell, and cotton. Vatican Museums, Vatican City.

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

12.

Installation view, Anishinaabe, Nipissing, and Kanien'kehá:ka, wampum belt, Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*, Vatican Museums, Vatican City, March 2023.

13.

Installation view, Lakota Sioux, Sun Dance drawing, Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*, Vatican Museums, Vatican City, March 2023.

14.

Cree, moccasins, ca. 1900. Moose hide and beads. Vatican Museums, Vatican City.

15.

Kwakwaka'wakw, Sun Dance mask, ca. 1920. Cedar and pigments. Vatican Museums, Vatican City.

16.

Causing trouble, 2023. Photograph with lettering by the author.

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

ILLUSTRATIONS • xiii

DUKE

**UNIVERSITY
PRESS**

Acknowledgments

I have been lucky to travel to many places and meet many interesting people to complete this book. The research never ends! In 2022 I completed a Terra Foundation for American Art fellowship at the American Academy in Rome, conducting research and documentation for the book. During the process of writing and research, many librarians and archivists have shared information with me. In Rome, the Propaganda Fide Library was a great help and resource. The Jesuit Archives, Archivum Generale OMI Romae, and the Capuchin Archive also shared documents. The Vatican Apostolic Library and Vatican Secret Archive also provided access and research support.

Anthropologists, conservators, art historians, archivists, and artists have provided interesting stories along the way. In Italy, *grazie mille* to Christine, Anna, Elisabetta, Emanuela, and Jennifer for their moral support. The book would not have been complete without a viewing of Gian Lorenzo Bernini's *Ecstasy of Saint Teresa* and seemingly almost divine intervention. Friends at the American Academy in Rome provided coffee and encouragement at the right moments. *Cappelletti*, good conversations, and good wine, discussing art, museum practices, and the eternal wonder of Rome kept me going. In North America, thank you to Silver, Mae, and my mom, Jane.

In Chicago, I spent time at the Newberry Library as a Frances C. Allen fellow, studying the sketchbooks of Ferdinand Pettrich. Yale Divinity Library and Archive holds an important collection of Italian children's games. The Mill Hill Missionaries Archive in Liverpool, England, shared with me an important set of photographs of the exhibition. I have traveled also to London to conduct archival work: thank you to the staff at the British Film Institute. Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (SSHRC) and

a FRQSC (Fonds québécois de la recherche sur la société et la culture) New Researchers Award supported my archival research in Italy, the United States, and Canada. During my doctoral studies, the Vanier Canada Graduate Scholarship program, the Joseph-Armand Bombardier Canada Graduate Scholarship (CGS), and the Cordula and Gunter Paetzold Fellowship at the University of British Columbia provided support. I completed a summer fellowship at the Terra Foundation for American Art in Giverny that was also an important moment to think through the work of Edmonia Lewis and the significance of world's fairs in the early twentieth century. Thank you to Ken and the editorial team at Duke University Press for their support in the production of the book.

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

Introduction

A NOMAD IN THE ROMAN ARCHIVES

Writing from the Margins

Journal: First Encounter with the Vatican Museums

APRIL 2016. *The sky gleamed a bright robin's-egg blue, and I felt excited, nervous, and jet-lagged as I headed toward the Vatican Museums. After months of preparing for this trip, I had finally arrived in Rome for my research. The city's mix of Renaissance and Baroque buildings casts long shadows. I perceived a different sense of space here, a more intimate impression of scale that I hadn't felt before in other cities. Walking by Gian Lorenzo Bernini's colonnade and the opulence of Saint Peter's on my way to Vatican City, I was filled with an overwhelming sense of excitement, as if I was floating through Rome.*

The Vatican Museums, with their thick stone walls and the entryway lined with security guards and their larger-than-life metal detectors, were an imposing,

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

austere space to enter. I waited in a long line to be admitted to the museum collections. I walked up a ramp that curled around like a snake, while most visitors took the elevators. Halfway up the ramp, I found myself on the Cortile delle Corazze, standing in front of a small display that reminded me of a natural history museum (figure I.1). Miniature models of canoes from the Americas and across the globe were on exhibit and, according to the wall text, intended to show the “respect of the Catholic universe toward non-European cultures.” They were the very canoes that had been sent in for the Vatican Missionary Exposition of 1925, and they continued a strange afterlife here, in an out-of-the-way entry point, and also on display below in the basement as part of the Vatican Missionary Ethnological Museum. These belongings, literally and symbolically ostracized from the other collections, reinforced the patronizing perspective of pope Pius XI, who demanded Indigenous artworks from across the globe be sent in for the 1925 exposition to glorify missionaries as heroes.¹ Beside the vitrines were blown-up black-and-white photographs of unnamed Indigenous peoples, placed there without any contextual information, erasing any sense of their identities or the specificities of their cultures. The display reminded me of exhibitions of First Nations art in other European and North American museums, such as the Musée du Quai Branly in Paris, where the curatorial emphasis was placed on the “premodern and primitive” nature of Indigenous peoples; there was no acknowledgment of their modernity.² I was shocked that the Vatican Museums were repeating the same display strategy and colonial language of possession and propaganda the curators had used in the exposition’s Halls of the Americas almost a century earlier. For me, however, the canoes were also a reminder of the multiple innovative technologies Indigenous peoples use for transport and the many ways that Indigenous peoples move across time and space.

After photographing the collection of miniature canoes, I went to the Missionary Ethnological Museum, which the Vatican has situated in the basement beside the exits, restaurant, and bathrooms, and beneath the Pinacoteca. The Pinacoteca houses masterpieces of Italian art and is given a very prominent location in the Vatican Museums. The position of First Peoples art, situated directly below the Pinacoteca in a dark and out-of-the-way location, evoking the problematic hierarchies of art, is not a coincidence in my mind. I walked down the stairs into the basement. A rush of visitors hustled by as I peered through the glass. Although I had been denied curatorial access to the Vatican Missionary Ethnological Museum, I went to see what I could see regardless. Through the clear glass I could make out German artist Ferdinand Pettrich’s busts and full-length figures in the center of the room (figure I.2). I thought to myself how little had changed; in photographs from 1925, Pettrich’s sculptures also stood front and center in the Hall of North America, while the reviewers ignored the Indigenous cultural belongings



FIGURE I.1. Installation of miniature canoes from Turtle Island at the entrance of the Vatican Museums, Vatican City, May 2023. Photograph by the author.



FIGURE I.2. Installation view, sculptures by Ferdinand Pettrich, Vatican Missionary Ethnological Museum, Vatican Museums, Vatican City, April 2016. Photograph by the author.

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

around them. The curatorial texts in the exhibition described the materials as “gifts” given to pope Pius XI, thus repeating the same colonial and missionary language of possession and ownership that denied the cultural belongings as signifiers of Indigenous peoples’ cultural and intellectual sovereignty. The term “gift” also incorrectly denoted that they were freely given. I kept looking, and I saw pottery and other cultural belongings from across Turtle Island. The pottery appeared to be from the Acoma Pueblo, an Indigenous community of the Southwest.

Peering at the display through the glass and at the museum texts, I thought about the irony of it all. How could so little have changed in terms of curatorial methods in the twenty-first century? Feelings of annoyance and anger and dread rushed through me at the patronizing tone presented by the museum texts and display methods. I wanted to throw a rock into the glass cases and shatter the exhibition. I took note of my reaction and continued walking.

The Vatican Missionary Exposition

On Sunday, December 21, 1924, pope Pius XI solemnly ascended the Vatican staircase and opened the holy door to the Vatican Missionary Exposition (VME). Standing in one of the exhibition’s central rooms, the Hall of North America, surrounded by stolen sacred and secular cultural belongings of the Indigenous peoples of North America, he welcomed tourists and pilgrims alike into the Vatican.³ Pius XI proclaimed 1925 to be a “holy year,” a church jubilee. The commemorative card shown in plate 1 emphasizes the year as a sacred event, and the VME was central to the celebrations. This unprecedented exhibition was held on the grounds of the Vatican, with specially designed pavilions showcasing the art and artifacts from missions across the continents, including the Americas, Asia, Oceania, and Africa. Pius XI declared that the materials sent in from afar shone light in the darkness to highlight missionary work. Upon the exposition’s closing, he further professed that the objects displayed had a “silent eloquence.”⁴ By using these words he meant the objects functioned as hushed markers of missionary progress, rendering the Indigenous makers and their belongings as voiceless in a paternalistic and romanticizing framework that continues to this day in the exhibition spaces of the Vatican Museums (Musei Vaticani). This phrase also informs what I call “pope culture,” an ethos of conquest and plunder that harkens back to the exploitation of Indigenous peoples since the Renaissance. After Pius XI closed the VME, he established the Missionary Ethnological Museum in 1926. In 2019 the Mis-

sionary Ethnological Museum changed its name to the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*, a collection that imprisons more than ten thousand Indigenous American belongings.

In contrast to these colonial and missionary views, this book argues that the Indigenous materials displayed at the VME are cultural belongings and travelers that were sent to Rome but never returned home. By focusing on material culture, this project centers the ongoing importance of artworks for Indigenous communities and offers a multitude of new ways of thinking through Indigenous experiences during the period of the VME, as well as considering Indigenous artists and artistry in Rome in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. In this book, I focus on Indigenous American artists and artworks and draw inspiration from the art and activism of Indigenous artists globally. A key aim of this study, which analyzes many archives and artists across Italy and Turtle Island (Canada and the United States), is to upset and unsettle the discourse of complacent Vatican missionary institutions.

Drawing inspiration from the broader methodological shift in the humanities on the part of scholars of Indigenous and settler descent toward telling stories that center Indigenous artists and artworks, this study rethinks art history and visual culture to destabilize the language and legacies of settler colonialism and emphasize Indigenous ways.³ As an Indigenous scholar of Métis heritage, I have woven sketches of my personal experience into my archival research and theoretically inflected textual analysis. Presenting my journaling, correspondence, and photography creates a personal, embodied narrative that contrasts with the many sterile and colonial archival environments I have worked in across Italy, the United States, and Canada. My journal entries tilt the hierarchy of value that exists within the European and American archival structures and modes of history writing I have encountered, and thus diminish the understanding of archival documents as privileged forms of acceptable, dominant knowledge. By including my personal experience as part of the scholarly analysis, the work questions and expands what counts as art history.

Eternal Sovereigns focuses on the art histories of Indigenous activists, artists, missionaries, and travelers as well as cultural belongings that have engaged with Rome and the Vatican from 1830 to the present day. By concentrating on the Halls of the Americas at the VME and focusing on Indigenous experiences and histories in Canada and the United States, this project is the first to take up the history of Indigeneity as presented in exhibitions at the Vatican and in Rome.⁶ To this day, the recognition of Indigenous presences at the Vatican remains largely unacknowledged, a situation that perpetuates the

settler-colonial myth that Indigenous people have disappeared and furthers the structural violence of Catholicism. *Eternal Sovereigns* will change the conversation by bringing to light what has been deleted, ignored, and silenced to create a new story about Indigeneity and art at the Vatican. Pius XI celebrated the VME during what was also one of the most aggressive assimilative periods of the Indian Act in Canada (1876 to present). Thus, unpacking the VME allows us to expand our knowledge of collecting histories, analyze global exhibitions of art in the colonial era, consider ethical concerns around consent and stolen Indigenous cultural belongings, and come to a moment of reckoning with the legacy of residential schools. Whereas previous scholars have focused on the Catholic theological and anthropological aspects of the VME, this study centers and adds nuance to Indigenous American visual culture and insists on recognizing the multiple ways Indigenous and papal visual culture interact and are part of unfolding power displays.⁷

The book's title, *Eternal Sovereigns*, asserts that Indigenous nations retained, and continue to maintain, sovereignty over their representations—on their own terms—despite the impact of forced Catholic colonization as well as the obfuscating forces of the western canon of art history. Sovereignty is a term that references the reclamation of Indigenous power and agency across time, space, and scholarly disciplines.⁸ In this context, I use it to reclaim, restore, and re-story Indigenous visual and material culture. The book also examines the competing sovereignties of settler, Indigenous, and papal visual culture. Through an analysis of a variety of images and objects—such as the statuary of Native American delegations; artworks including beaded moccasins, drawings, and sculptures by Native American artists; and children's games made by missionaries and missionary accounts—this book examines the mobility and global reception of Indigenous artists and artworks in Rome at a time when ethnography and Indigenous art were burgeoning in the global imagination and Rome was being transformed into a modern city. Art historian Hal Foster's ideas about archives remind me that projects like mine can be “retrieved in a gesture of alternative knowledge or countermemory.”⁹ Such a study is of great importance today, as the Vatican has yet to return these belongings to the people from whom they were stolen.

The Halls of the Americas section of the VME, the primary focus of this study, held over four thousand objects, including photographs, sculptures, textiles, and wax mannequin displays, organized by the anthropologist and Verbitic priest Wilhelm Schmidt. Drawing on archival evidence, Indigenous methodologies of storytelling, and art historical analysis, I re-story the Halls of the Americas to reclaim and reanimate Indigenous visual culture that was

displayed and remained in Pius XI's collection afterward. The book focuses on Indigenous peoples of Canada and the United States whose cultural belongings were featured at the VME, and it critically analyzes representations of Indigenous peoples in sculpture, drawing, and photography in the VME's illustrated journal, the *Rivista Illustrata della Esposizione Missionaria Vaticana* (Illustrated magazine of the Vatican Missionary Exposition).

Combining the tools of visual analysis from art history with interdisciplinary storytelling strategies, *Eternal Sovereigns* creates a research methodology that reframes Rome and develops new insights into global art exhibitions, international networks of Indigenous arts, and archival theories and methods. The title also suggests the holistic spiritual relationships that Indigenous artists had in the process of creating artworks displayed at the exhibition, and the nonlinear relationship between Indigenous souls and Indigenous travelers rather than the linear Christian one espoused at the VME and throughout the Vatican spaces today. The title also evokes the spirit and the everyday in which every Indigenous soul matters. This research works against the traumatic legacy of missionary labors at residential schools and throughout Indigenous communities across Turtle Island. Catholic missionaries operated the majority of residential schools and subjected Indigenous children to mental, physical, and spiritual abuse in an attempt to assimilate them into Canadian society. Over one hundred and fifty thousand First Nations, Métis, and Inuit children attended these horrific institutions and died as a result of these residential schools, and the trauma for survivors and their families continues.¹⁰

Terminology and Inspiration: *Indigenous*,
Indigeneity, and *Worldbuilding*

By using the term *Indigenous* as an Indigenous scholar, I connect my initiative with the broader political project of affirming rights for Indigenous peoples and with the goal of recognition for Indigenous studies worldwide. Within the Canadian context, *Indigenous* includes the First Nations, Métis, and Inuit, and within the United States, it is a reference to Native Americans. Whenever possible, I refer to an artist's particular community and name the Indigenous individual, to push back against the legacy of colonialism and lack of naming that occurred at the VME. Missionaries did not record the names of Indigenous artists, nor were their belongings considered art in the majority of the VME record. The haphazard way in which no names were recorded gives a sense of the colonial fury and greed of pope Pius XI's coercive practices and

his looting of sacred treasures from communities. Indigenous peoples' names did not matter, as if they were subhuman and without rights in the brutish collecting practices of papal greed. Today this dynamic of not naming continues in the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi* in a reiteration of the salvage paradigm and a reminder of the belongings as stolen treasures. The practice of naming more broadly in art history and the humanities is an ongoing research challenge since the archives often fail to acknowledge Indigenous and Black artists due to colonial methods of recordkeeping.

This book challenges several colonial assumptions prevalent in art historical literature on First Nations, Métis, Inuit, and Native Americans. For example, it exposes the false notion that Indigenous peoples and their cultural belongings had disappeared by the early twentieth century and that Indigenous people only lived outside modern metropolitan cultures and certainly not in Europe. This study contributes to the larger scholarship that examines the global mobility of Indigenous travelers and their belongings during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries by considering their agency, artistry, and audacity. By *audacity* I mean the perseverance of Indigenous artists to create artworks and live their lives under multiple forms of colonial duress.¹¹ This interdisciplinary method seeps into the archival cracks and contributes to archival studies, art history, and material culture studies, creating what I call “ancestral art history lessons.” I hope the stories and images contribute to understanding Indigeneity, Rome, and the Vatican in new, entangled, and unsettling relationships with one another. Studying the artistry and audacity of Indigenous artists in tension with missionary ephemera and accounts through the lens of the VME offers insights into Rome’s transformation into a modern city—one that is reliant on Indigenous arts and artists and permeated by the ongoing fraught dynamics of truth and reconciliation.¹²

Eternal Sovereigns builds on transnational Indigenous scholarship that emphasizes the mobility of Indigenous peoples and frames Indigenous arts within a global context. I align my thinking with Native scholars and activists such as Haida/Tsimshian art historian Marcia Crosby, who reminds us of the “Imaginary Indian” and the ways that settler-colonial identities have used Native representations as foils and projections for settler-colonial myths.¹³ However, I am more interested in how Indigenous people have played active roles in shaping their own lives. As Gwichya Gwich’in scholar Crystal Fraser and Métis scholar Zoe Todd note, “If Indigenous people are present in historical records, they are often depicted as passive bystanders, rarely free agents in their own right and far removed from narratives that highlight agency or sophistication.”¹⁴ Building on Fraser and Todd’s observation, *Eternal Sover-*

eigns emphasizes the entangled nature of Indigenous cultural belongings and the Catholic colonial archival record in the Eternal City, as Rome has long been called. My theoretical approach draws inspiration from thinkers such as Turtle Mountain Chippewa scholar Danika Medak-Saltzman, Anishinaabe literary scholar Gerald Vizenor, Apache curator and anthropologist Nancy Mithlo, Sioux historian Phillip Deloria, and Ho-Chunk museum scholar and historian Amy Lonetree, all of whom center their own experiences as Indigenous people working through complex colonial relations in the Americas.¹⁵ Anthropologist Ann Laura Stoler's articulation of archives as spaces of incomplete and fraught dynamics of colonial power provides a useful point of orientation for the archival element of the research, which goes "against the grain."¹⁶ Considering archives as repositories not only of colonial power, this book renders them as spaces that evidence the ways that Indigenous arts and peoples have influenced and intersected with colonizers on a global stage as actors and agents. It is a form of worldbuilding.

Journal: The Vatican Apostolic Library, Vatican City

DECEMBER 2016. *Pope Sixtus IV della Rovere founded the Vatican Apostolic Library in 1475. He initially donated pope Nicolas V's collection of 824 Latin manuscripts.¹⁷ Since then, the papal collections have grown substantially. Yesterday, with a bit of trepidation in my chest, I walked toward the Vatican and Saint Peter's down the large avenue cleared by Mussolini during the rebuilding of Rome in the 1930s (plate 2). The Maltese crèche was up, and the sun was a burnt red, looming over Saint Peter's and the Castel Sant'Angelo. As I was walking out the door, I said a prayer to the divine to help me with my research and to stay calm. I had an anxious feeling, not overwhelming but there, and one that I had come to associate with the entire Vatican City, but perhaps it was more appropriately suited to just my experience dealing with the Vatican Museums. It was warm out despite it being December. I walked through the main square at Saint Peter's. There were a few armed police officers in black uniforms and some tourists taking photos with selfie sticks. I continued to Porta Sant'Anna, and just at that moment Beyoncé's "Halo" came on in my headphones, tuned to Italian radio, and I wondered about the song about halos and heroes there in Vatican City, a city steeped in Christian and Roman iconography. I had a foreboding sense in the back of my mind because, in talking with several archivists in Rome, I had been warned that the people at the Vatican can be quite nasty and not to expect much. Extreme bureaucracy. It was very quiet and calm as I passed by a Swiss Guard at the entrance to Vatican*

City. He smiled and directed me to the Vatican passport office, where I dropped off my Canadian passport and proceeded about one hundred meters straight ahead, then under a curved arch and past another guard. I flashed my Vatican Secret Archive library card and took a right, then entered the first door, where the Vatican Library secretary worked. After waiting for fifteen minutes, I was summoned into the secretary's private office. A little crèche with an angel holding the word "Gloria" watched me as I filled out my information in block letters on a green paper to attain access to the archives.

I wondered about the appropriateness as well as the fatalistic aspect of my research. Could my work make a difference with all the patriarchal customs and bureaucratic measures in Vatican City and across Rome that I had encountered and continued to work through?

The secretary welcomed me with a microchip card and told me it was for life, all in quick Italian. She explained that I needed to sign in electronically every time I entered and exited the library, and that the microchip card was also needed to open and close the cloakroom. She then handed me a stack of papers about library expectations to read through. I saw a monk in a white robe with a few lines on his face and a twirled mustache. "Arrivederci," the porter said as I exited back into the courtyard. The space was massive and imposing as the walls of the museum encircled me. I looked ahead of me and noticed the square windows far above on the opposite wall. They were set back into the wall like a garrison, a reminder of the Vatican as a space of violence in its missionary and colonial endeavors. Several floors below, the Vatican Missionary Ethnological Museum holding Indigenous cultural belongings from around the globe waited for me.

On Secrecy, Whispers, and Missing Documents: Theorizing the Gaps in Colonial Archives

When I first set out to do this research, I was not sure what I would find in the archives, although I imagined I might uncover missionary bulletins, including accounts written by missionaries about their experiences of fieldwork with Indigenous communities and their lives more broadly. I have looked through archives across Rome, including the Propaganda Fide Library and Archive, Societas Verbi Divini Archive, Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu, Archivum Generale OMI Romae, Vatican Apostolic Library, Vatican Secret Archive, and the Vatican Fototeca Archive. I have also consulted the Oblate archives and Jesuit archives in Canada and made inquiries to archives in the United States, England, Ireland, and Mexico. I have perused the Edward E.

Ayer Special Collections of the Newberry Library in Chicago and the Yale Divinity Library Special Collections. The archives, collections, and materials I have consulted are representative of Catholic missionary history and more broadly of the western colonial archive. Even after conducting research for this book in Italy and Turtle Island for more than eight years, including secret meetings with archivists and curators, the process remains difficult—it is like a time warp in that it can go on without end if one lets it. The archives contain numerous objects, including photographs of the VME, a plethora of missionary bulletins from various religious orders, official papal decrees on the material to be sent in, and the *Rivista Illustrata*. These materials, although numerous, represent only one side of the story. They do not tell an Indigenous-focused narrative or include key Indigenous histories. The colonial and uneven nature of the documents in the archive provides a jumping off point, though. The stories I am telling are part of a creation of Indigenous art histories, of using fragmented evidence to establish new ways of understanding Indigenous American arts and lives through the lens of the exhibition in Vatican City.

Notes from Rome: “Indigenous People Need to Get Over Genocide,” Unanswered Letters, and Archival Experiences

My journal reflections and more personal analyses in this book create a counternarrative to the static record of the official VME. The Vatican Museums’ website describes it in this way: “In 1925 Pope Pius XI organised a major event: the Vatican Exposition, to make known the cultural, artistic and spiritual traditions of all peoples. The great success of the Exposition, which displayed more than 100,000 objects and works of art from all over the world to more than a million visitors, convinced the Pontiff to transform the temporary event into a permanent exhibition.”¹⁸ As anthropologist Johannes Fabian notes, “Reflexivity asks that we ‘look back’ and thereby let our experiences ‘come back’ to us.”¹⁹ My research process has not been linear or straightforward, and I have encountered many roadblocks, such as documents that went missing in archives after requesting them, reticent and reluctant curators, nasty conservators, whispers, and inaccessible archives. This is evidence of the structural violence of archival spaces, a pattern that has become more apparent as I study the archives further. By structural violence I mean the lack of access for scholars to some of the Vatican archives and holdings, including those of the Vatican Missionary Ethnological Museum (now *Anima Mundi*),

for reasons never explained, and the ambivalence of curators and archivists about making material accessible.

This suppression of archival documents and indifference to research requests is unethical. I also refer here to the Vatican Museums' lack of response to requests to visit cultural belongings from myself and other Indigenous curators working in the field as well as emails and meetings with a conservator at the American Academy in Rome, during one of which she exclaimed to me over a cappuccino, "Indigenous people need to get over genocide."²⁰ This type of simplistic yet revealing colonial thinking is present also in the Vatican catalogs and the overall narrative presented in the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*. I also raise here the historical and ongoing brutality caused by missionary labors and the structural programs of genocide enacted through things such as the 1493 papal bull *Inter caetera* (discussed below) and later the imposition of the Indian Act. The Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi* is in essence a violation of human rights. In not acknowledging the impacts of Catholic colonialism, including the papal bulls, the colonial devastation of the 1925 Vatican Missionary Exposition, the ongoing legacy of residential schools, and the genocidal labor of missionaries in Indigenous communities, and in obscuring the narratives of looting and plunder which form the basis of the collection, the Vatican Museums perpetuate papal violence. In countering this violence, this project joins the work of researchers across disciplines who are recovering unacknowledged histories that have yet to be narrated and creating countermemories.²¹

It is important to note here that the Vatican's "ethnological collection" was closed for about a decade, but now it is open again, as the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*, and visitors can visit some Indigenous belongings from the Americas. The belongings, stolen treasures, are displayed without Indigenous makers' names, community names, or any discussion of the devastation caused by the VME and pope Pius XI's greed.²² Gaining entry to the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi* archive and collections held in storage is an ongoing research challenge, and its archive remains largely inaccessible due to its unethical practices of document suppression, exclusion of Indigenous researchers and community requests, and ambivalence regarding ethics. Over the past eight years, I have written several times to pope Francis; written to the current curator at the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*, Father Mapelli; spoken and exchanged written correspondence with conservators and Vatican curators; spoken with Jesuit archivists and Capuchin archivists in Rome; and written to Prime Minister Justin Trudeau and former Minister of Aboriginal Affairs Carolyn Bennett of Canada regarding my research and the lack of access

to the archive for researchers (two of my letters are included in the appendix of this book). As of this writing, no Indigenous researchers from Turtle Island, including myself, have been granted access.²³ This is part of the Vatican's ongoing structural violence and lack of willingness to enter into a conversation about decolonial practices. I also understand this lack of access as part of the rhetoric of decolonization.

This book's analysis of the VME, and with it an acknowledgment of colonial and Indigenous histories, is a way of moving beyond the rhetoric of truth and reconciliation into understanding and reckoning with the past as it unfolds in the present. The archival record requires a critical reinterpretation in order to center Indigenous perspectives and issues within the VME narrative and work against the structural violence and culture of conquest present at the Vatican. When I first encountered documents in the Vatican archives, I did not know how to "read" them; they presented me with an almost insurmountable hostility and the ambivalence of missionary oppression. I want to unpack this violence and look beyond the prejudiced surface readings that were offered in the VME. As South African historian Helena Pohlandt-McCormick wrote about her experiences working with archival documents in the context of apartheid, "Documents are never innocent."²⁴ Especially for Indigenous histories, it is crucial to critique archives that have enabled colonialism. Take, for example, the papal bull *Inter caetera*, issued in March 1493 by pope Alexander VI. Indigenous people, according to this decree, did not have souls and were considered subhuman, thereby legitimizing the Catholic Church's colonial project of expansion in the Americas by enslaving Indigenous people. This work included the genocide of Indigenous communities and the destruction of Indigenous artworks. This document is held at the Vatican archives, the very place where I conducted my fieldwork. During the genocide of Indigenous peoples of the Americas, this and other documents were used to justify colonialism and negate the livelihoods of Indigenous Americans, with devastating and profound impacts. By 1512, pope Julius II had adjusted papal attitudes toward Indigenous peoples and recognized them as people with souls, yet they were still seen as in need of Christian redemption.²⁵ Four hundred and thirty-two years later, the VME reiterated the same limited language and linear Christian concept of time found in the papal bulls regarding the redemption of the souls of "pagans." For example, it promised that the exhibition would "present to visitors the life, customs and habits of the most obscure tribes in the remotest regions of the earth."²⁶

Scholars are deeply implicated in the archive on many levels. For example, historian Antoinette Burton writes that when the intellectual Durba Ghosh

was doing archival work in India and London, “She was not only reading the archives, the archives were also reading her.”²⁷ In many ways, I, too, was shaped by the processes of working in the archives, especially since I was conducting archival conversations in Italian and English with curators, Jesuit archivists, Native studies allies in Rome, and others. I have worked in Italian and English; written correspondence in Italian, French, and English; and read archival documents in Italian, English, and French. I have also encountered some Algonquin language dictionaries and other Indigenous language materials that were seized by missionaries for the library at the VME.²⁸ Thus, the project requires an engagement with multiple languages and much translation. All this, too, remains a partial process and presents a larger complexity than if I were working solely with English documents.

Thinkers in Indigenous studies must contend with an extra layer of accountability for our research processes and writing: we knowingly work with archival records that always remain partial. Todd and Fraser note that “for Indigenous peoples, access to state or church archives is complicated, given ongoing settler-colonial realities that frame and govern archives in Canada.” They add that “to decolonise the archives requires an erasure or negation of the colonial realities of the archives themselves. Given the inherent colonial realities of the archives as institutions, any effort to decolonise or Indigenise the archives in Canada can therefore only ever be partial.”²⁹ As a Métis person, I can attest to the mental, emotional, and physical struggles of working through archives. Knowing that Indigenous peoples have been subject to emotional, physical, and intellectual brutality that continues due to the ongoing legacies of settler colonialism, particularly the remnants of missionary-based programs, produces a weight and a sense of responsibility.

Throughout this process, I have had numerous phone calls with my mom, who supports my work. We remain engaged with the realities of Indigenous peoples and with challenging the systemic racism that Indigenous communities have faced and still do. We talk about youth suicide and the legacy of residential schools and how we can address these terrible realities. My mom inspires my work, and for that I am thankful. I do not take my position for granted as a scholar. The more research I do, the more I read, write, and teach, the more important I feel it is to be writing histories that engage Indigenous issues. The words of Indigenous curators Lee-Ann Martin and Gerald McMaster resonate with me: “To be an Aboriginal person, to identify with an indigenous heritage in these late colonial times, requires a life of reflection, critique, persistence and struggle.”³⁰ In this spirit of persistence, I present this book.

In straddling the disciplines of art history and archival studies, I am pulled toward the importance of visual analysis and the politics of art, and also drawn into telling and creating Indigenous histories. This work aims to bring these two disciplines together and rethink them. The book draws on a variety of material culture, and I also include a series of altered photographs based on my archival and museum encounters (see figure 3.4 and plates 2, 10, and 16). Positioning neon lettering and emphatic phrases over photographs of sterile archival spaces unsettles both the archive and the image in ways that complement my scholarly analysis. I produce the altered images to put cracks into the archive on historical and ideological levels as well as to provide new ways of imagining colonial spaces that speaks to Indigenous ways of being and thinking and the loss encountered through missionary violence. I consider this project as a type of worldbuilding. In the various images, I have experimented with horizontal, vertical, and diagonal phrases in English and Cree and have used numbers drawn from the Vatican missionary archives to complicate the sterile facade of statistical data and facts present in the VME record.³¹ These images also deploy a form of confusion and disorientation to unsettle the Vatican spaces. I hope the altered photographs and the re-storying of the Vatican exhibition create a way of honoring Indigenous lives and experiences that were never acknowledged within archival records.

Perhaps when I started this research, I imagined a complete record might have been available in the archives. Since then, I have amassed a large collection of missionary ephemera and documents about the VME, but they persist in telling only one side of the story and thus function in many ways as a trap.³² Moreover, traces within the documents themselves suggest Indigenous alternatives. The documents are not objective truths, but crafted articulations. For example, the *Rivista Illustrata*, the illustrated journal of the VME, remains a critical source for my project, but I was overwhelmed when I first started flipping through it as it includes over eight hundred pages of writing by missionaries, complemented by photographs. Initially I focused on some photographs of Indigenous women and men in the southwest United States, and on closer inspection, I realized the captions and descriptions of the images had multiple errors. This presented an important moment to begin to question the entire structure of “truth” presented within the exhibition spaces and to understand the fallibility of the interpretations in the *Rivista Illustrata*. The curatorial arrangement of Indigenous arts and material culture within the exhibition

space and the *Rivista Illustrata* served the VME's agenda to render Indigenous peoples as static, mute, and without agency.

The lure of the archives, the ever-present possibility that I might find something new, drew me further and further into them in an endless hunt. This search is a seductive one; I could keep exploring archives across the world in the hope that I might come across another trace of the VME, what philosopher Jacques Derrida alludes to as the possibility and lack of the archive.³³ Especially for Indigenous artists and scholars, a sustained engagement with colonial archives has been fruitful not only for understanding the legacies of colonialism but also for creating new spaces for Indigenous articulations. Certainly this project is about archival documents, but it is also about what is not in the archive, what is beyond the scope of papal understanding and missionary writing. In this way, Indigenous perspectives on art and history can be illuminating for understanding other histories not presented in the limited scope of the *Rivista Illustrata* or the Halls of the Americas. For Indigenous peoples, stories are theories that inform ways of being in the world, and appreciating this capacity provides another path of illuminating the significance of Indigenous cultural belongings.

Notes from Rome: Beyond the Time and Culture of Conquest

In 2016, Indigenous leaders from several First Nations across Turtle Island participated in the Long March to Rome, calling for the rescinding of these papal edicts. Their march pushed back against colonial time and space and the disastrous impacts articulated by the papal bulls legitimizing *terra nullius* (treating land as if it belonged to no one) and the accompanying Doctrine of Discovery (allowing the “discoverers” to take possession). In 2022, an Indigenous delegation from Turtle Island, including youth and elders from First Nations and Métis and Inuit communities, was brought into a corner of the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*, which was not open to the public yet, and haphazardly shown stolen belongings from their communities. A few stolen belongings were brought out, with no information provided. The museum's curator Father Mapelli and the staff insisted they were stewards of the collection, and the delegation was not permitted to handle or hold their own community belongings. This colonial dynamic continues.

Looking at the photographs of staff in the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi* handling Indigenous American belongings is disturbing and informative.

In particular, the photographs show Vatican curator Father Mapelli and conservationists handling and pointing at Indigenous belongings, such as the Inuvialuit kayak seized by Catholic missionaries for the VME.³⁴ This special seal skin kayak, made with skill and care to transport and sustain Inuit communities, is an archive of Indigenous knowledge and arctic sovereignty. To me these photographs showing the conservators and curators wrongfully handling Indigenous belongings and the policing of touch by the Vatican Museums is a reminder of the ongoing violence of the Vatican Museums, a signifier of the abuse of Indigenous peoples and greedy seizure of sacred belongings by pope Pius XI. Thousands of Indigenous belongings remain as prisoners behind glass in the museum and in the subterranean vaults, bereft from their communities, makers, and Indigenous care. Indigenous conservation methods are not employed, and Indigenous curators and communities are not consulted. Indigenous communities have made some requests for repatriation of cultural belongings, but to date nothing has been returned, and the Vatican does not engage in restitution, consultation, or outreach.³⁵ Throughout *Eternal Sovereigns*, I consider the Roman archives in tension with the activism and presence of First Peoples, which work as a counternarrative to Vatican colonial policy.

Many Indigenous interpretations and orientations are beyond the space and time of colonial archives, and today more than ever these Indigenous spaces and narratives matter. In this story, many Indigenous cultural belongings and Indigenous American artists, such as Edmonia Lewis (1844–1907), ventured beyond familiar territories to Rome and the space of the Vatican, creating and occupying new places of potential for Indigenous peoples. The presence of Indigenous cultural belongings and Lewis's engagements within the city of Rome are expansive alternative conceptions to the limited linear narrative suggested by the VME. The research focuses on Indigenous experience in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, but an engagement with Indigeneity at the Vatican also requires one to think expansively into previous centuries and into the future. I am interested here in honoring Indigenous lives, the artists who were once known but never named, the artists who were living in Rome such as Lewis, and the cultural belongings that never got the respect they deserved at the VME. I see this research as a gesture toward honoring the many unacknowledged lives of Indigenous makers, artists, missionaries, and scholars who traveled and slept and reside today in Rome.

Many, indeed, thousands, of Indigenous travelers reside today as prisoners in the strongholds of the Vatican, taken by missionaries to satisfy papal greed and lust over the centuries. The VME was one of the most profound examples

of papal avarice in the early twentieth century and part of the salvage paradigm of colonial collecting and fascist colonial expansion. Its legacy and colonial influence continue. For example, there are many important early Latin American Indigenous belongings and documents held at the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi* and the Vatican Apostolic Library. This study is a historiography of Indigenous cultural belongings, reframing papal narratives of conquest and greed and unpacking the lack of consent in Vatican Museums' displays and archival practices. This project reframes histories of collecting and provides an alternative history of world exhibitions and the VME, questioning and decolonizing the "gift" language and legacy prevalent in the Vatican archives and museums. Many of the Indigenous cultural belongings and archives discussed in this book have never been adequately studied due to the Vatican Museums' suppression of their archival records and their gatekeeping. Not allowing Indigenous researchers and other scholars to access and research their precious community belongings is ongoing horrible violence. While museums across the globe are working with Indigenous communities to repatriate and rematriate their colonial-era collections, the Vatican Museums remain firm in their stance of papal greed with the ongoing incarceration of Indigenous life.

The dreadful legacy of missionary-cum-papal violence continues and is made tangible throughout by including my journal entries and analysis of material and visual culture. Thus, this book takes up a form of storytelling and worldbuilding by shifting the narrative to cultural belongings, travelers, and artists that were previously unacknowledged and ignored and by placing Indigenous travelers at the heart of the story to disrupt the Vatican's colonial purview. The dynamic of papal control suppressing Indigenous cultural belongings and spirituality at the VME continues to this day in the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*. This book will unsettle ambivalent Vatican discourse, providing further material and impetus for study centering Indigenous artists, activists, and travelers by piercing the colonial heart of the Vatican and raising awareness of the precious Indigenous American heritage held captive in the Vatican vaults and the genocidal history of the Catholic church. The book is also about bringing back honor and respect for historical and contemporary Indigenous communities. The book is a new and an old story about Rome contributing to creative ways of decolonizing museum ethics and archives, Italian studies, and unsettling art history. It is imperative we understand Indigenous art and papal collections and come to a moment of reckoning with colonial church history in the broader discourse of truth and reconciliation across the globe.

Chapter Summaries

The larger historical sweep of the book begins with a prehistory of the Indian Museum (as it was first called) at the Vatican and then moves through an analysis of the 1925 exhibition that is interspersed with my recent archival encounters in the Vatican and throughout Rome. It concludes with Anthony Martin Fernando's protest at the VME, an account that underscores the timeliness of the book's exploration of Indigenous cultural sovereignty.

Chapter 1, "Unsettling the Indian Museum in Rome: Ferdinand Pettrich and Edmonia Wildfire Lewis," provides a historical precursor to the VME by placing the sculptures and life experiences of Ferdinand Pettrich, a white German artist, in productive comparison with those of Edmonia Lewis, an Ojibwe and Haitian American artist.³⁶ By assessing the two artists and visually analyzing their work, the chapter unsettles core colonial assumptions espoused in studies of neoclassical art: that Indigenous peoples belonged in the past, had no place in the future, and existed only on the margins of civilization. Comparing Pettrich's and Lewis's lives and artworks challenges the binaries of past/present, wild/civil, and Indigenous/settler within neoclassical art. Their relationship has not been documented in the colonial archive, and my consideration of the two artists together constitutes an intervention in art history. Staging a creative dialogue between the evidence of Lewis's artworks and life and Pettrich's "Indian Museum," which he displayed at the Vatican, extends conceptions of Indigeneity as a state of survival amid the violence of colonial rule. Both artists led international lives and traveled across the globe, circulating ideals and ideas of Indigeneity through their artworks and their personal encounters with collectors, the Vatican, admirers, and nemeses. Considering their efforts in tension provides new insights into the problem of agency in representing Indigenous nations in art, ways of thinking about Indigenous presence in Rome and at the Vatican Museums, and the limits of neoclassicism as an artistic genre and a colonial mindset.

The second chapter, "'The Most Exhaustive Record of the World's Progress Ever Displayed': Pope Pius XI's Culture of Conquest and Visitors' Experiences at the Vatican Missionary Exposition," contends that the arrangement and interpretation of Indigenous arts and material culture within the exhibition space of the VME and the pages of the *Rivista Illustrata* served the VME's goal by rendering Indigenous nations as static. It first provides a detailed discussion of the VME, showing how the vast number of materials from all over the globe overwhelmed missionary organizers and visitors to the exposition. In the

Halls of the Americas and within the *Rivista Illustrata*, the organizers at the Vatican portrayed Indigenous Americans as pagans who existed outside the time and space of western progress and Christian civilization, rather than as contemporary citizens of the world. By creating a visual regime to produce so-called knowledge, the VME used Indigenous American visual culture to form what pope Pius XI called “silent eloquence.” He positioned Indigenous visual culture as trophies of his domain to glorify missionaries as heroes. The chapter further contextualizes the exhibition by imagining a visitor walking through the grandeur and cacophony of 1920s Rome and Saint Peter’s and into the VME. To conclude, it considers a series of contemporary fairs and expositions to contextualize the VME as a competitive spectacle and a form of “pope culture” in the age of world’s fairs.

The third chapter, “A Window on the World’ of Colonial Unknowing: Dioramas, Children’s Games, and Missionary Perspectives at the Vatican Missionary Exposition,” focuses on missionary viewpoints. Dioramas and board games for children that were included in the VME form part of the cultural archive and constitute the visual evidence of the exposition’s attempt to present itself as a “window on the world.” However, as I argue, the VME was replete with colonial unknowing and actively denied and disavowed Indigenous agency in the Americas.³⁷ The children’s games displayed at the exhibition had bright colors, stereotypical imagery of Indigenous peoples, and instructions to baptize and pray for “heathens.” They encouraged children and adults to understand Indigenous communities and their cultural practices as property of the Catholic Church and without agency. To counteract this elision, the second half of the chapter incorporates a discussion of the realities that Indigenous children of the Americas faced in residential schools run by Catholic missionaries in North America in the early twentieth century. The chapter argues that the VME must be understood within a larger global network of institutions that were part of the settler-colonial project to eradicate Indigenous lifeways. For readers in North America, residential schools are likely the most familiar and notorious of these institutions, and this chapter connects the role of vision and art making that these schools mobilized in “educating” Indigenous children to the VME. The games and the dioramas of the VME offer a “window on the world” into the attitudes of missionaries toward Indigenous children—evidence of how their seeing, looking, and understanding flowed one way. Missionary attitudes and practices perpetuated violence against Indigenous peoples in the Americas.

The fourth chapter, “Eternal Sovereigns and Ancestral Art: Ancient Archives, Relatives, and Travelers at the Vatican Missionary Exposition,” works

against the official Vatican narrative to consider how cultural belongings made using Indigenous methods and hands resonate beyond missionary anxiety and outside the colonial space of the Halls of the Americas. Although missionaries and pope Pius XI considered them as silent markers of missionary progress because of their removal from Indigenous communities, I contend that they endure in the present as markers of Indigenous cosmologies and understandings. The chapter focuses on five works by once-known Indigenous artists: an Anishinaabe, Nipissing, and Kanien'kehá:ka wampum belt, a Passamaquoddy Christ on the Cross, a Lakota Sun Dance drawing, Cree beaded moccasins, and a Kwakwaka'wakw ancestral sun mask (see figures 4.2–4.4 and plates 11–15). The artworks have a persuasive glory and power that the missionaries working for the VME and recent curators at the Vatican Museums failed to consider in their brief and problematic interpretations in the *Rivista Illustrata* and the catalog *The Americas: Collections from the Vatican Ethnological Museum* (2015).³⁸ Indigenous cultural belongings matter; as teachers, ancient archives, and evidence of self-sustaining practices, they create ancestral art history lessons that disrupt both pope Pius XI's and pope Francis's logic of "silent eloquence" and the pervasive but not all-encompassing views of missionaries and visitors.

The book closes with an epilogue about Anthony Martin Fernando (1864–1949), an Aboriginal activist who protested settler colonialism at the entrance to the 1925 exposition by giving political leaflets to visitors. Although Fernando may have thought of himself as a lone activist—and certainly the headline of his leaflet suggests that he thought of himself as one of a few—his actions may be considered more broadly as one of countless Indigenous acts of survival and resistance during the VME and beyond.³⁹ Fernando's narrative, like Lewis's story and those conveyed by Indigenous cultural belongings, present the experience of Indigenous peoples' engagements with Rome and the Vatican as makers of history and brings us into an Indigenous time and space beyond the culture of conquest.

DUKE

UNIVERSITY
PRESS

A NOMAD IN THE ROMAN ARCHIVES • 21

Notes

INTRODUCTION. A NOMAD IN THE ROMAN ARCHIVES

1. Pius XI's demands and coercive methods of collecting for the 1925 Vatican Missionary Exposition (VME) then formed the basis of the Vatican Missionary Ethnological Museum, established in 1926. In 2019 the museum changed its name to Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*. The VME was one of the largest Catholic missionary expositions in Europe during the early twentieth century and showcased stolen Indigenous art as well as sacred and secular belongings taken from Indigenous communities across the globe. The museum and its collections were largely closed off for approximately twenty years from the early 2000s until 2023, with funding being dedicated to the establishment of a conservation lab in 2000, which remains the priority today. The majority of the collections remain in the sealed vaults. To this day, the artworks and belongings have not been returned or repatriated to communities despite requests in a brutish battle that continues.

2. The Musée du Quai Branly–Jacques Chirac has a vast array of photographs and cultural belongings from Indigenous America. See Musée du Quai Branly–Jacques Chirac, “History of the Collections,” accessed August 28, 2023, <https://www.quaibranly.fr/en/collections/all-collections/history-of-the-collections>.

3. My use of the term *cultural belonging* is inspired by the 2015 series of exhibitions *Ćasna?əm: The City before the City*, which traced the ancestral presence of the Musqueam, dating back five thousand years, to their current presence in Vancouver across three sites: the Museum of Vancouver, the Museum of Anthropology, and the Musqueam Cultural Centre. See Museum of Vancouver, “Ćasna?əm: The City before the City,” accessed August 18, 2023, <https://museumofvancouver.ca/csnam-the-city-before-the-city/>. The use of the term is also inspired by the artistic practice and oeuvre of Lakota multimedia artist Dana Claxton.

4. “Silent eloquence” is the term pope Pius XI used to describe the VME. Pius XI, *Rerum Ecclesiae*.

5. Important studies in the field include Lonetree, *Decolonizing Museums*; Nahwegahbow, “From Great-Grandmothers to Great-Granddaughters”; Racette, Corbiere, and Migwans, “Pieces Left along the Trail”; Igloliorte and Taunton, “Continuities between Eras.”

6. Like other collections of Indigenous American material in Italy, the Vatican collections extend back several centuries. Of importance here, the first missionary museum in Rome was established by the German-born Jesuit polymath and collector Athanasius Kircher (1602–80), who amassed various materials from the Americas, including ceremonial pipes and wampum belts that were sent in by Jesuits along with cultural belongings from the four corners of the globe. Kircher’s museum, a “theatre of nature and art,” was housed in the Jesuit Collegio Romano collection and was later amalgamated into the Vatican Museums. See Rowland, *Ecstatic Journey*. See also Lugli, “Inquiry as Collection.” Recent scholarship in Renaissance studies of the early modern period, such as the work of art historian Lia Markey, explores Indigenous art collections of the Americas in Florence, namely material things in the “New World” collections that include feather paintings. Markey focuses primarily on South America. See Markey, *Imagining the Americas*. The Beltrami collection of Indigenous art in Bergamo is also an important and understudied collection. See Museo Civico Scienze Naturali Enrico Caffi, “Nord America,” accessed January 24, 2024, <https://www.museoscienzebergamo.it/senza-categoria/nord-america/>. See also Marino, “Preview of the Beltrami Collection.”

7. For an anthropologist’s view of the exhibition, see Kahn, “Mind over Matter.” See also Amaral, “Exhibiting Faith.”

8. On sovereignty, see Raheja, “Visual Sovereignty,” 29; Rickard, “Sovereignty,” 51; D’Angeli, “Dancing Chiaux, Dancing Sovereignty.”

9. Foster, “Archival Impulse,” 4.

10. For more information on this genocide, see Truth and Reconciliation Commission (Canada), *They Came for the Children*.

11. On transnational studies of Indigenous travelers, artists, and missionaries, see Harney and Phillips, *Mapping Modernisms*; Burns, *Transnational Frontiers*; Friesen and Chladiuk, *Lakota Performers*; Horton, *Art for an Undivided Earth*; Voelker, “Unfixing the Frame.”

12. Tuck and Yang, “Decolonization Is Not a Metaphor.”

13. Crosby, “Construction of the Imaginary Indian.”

14. Todd and Fraser, “Decolonial Sensibilities.”

15. Medak-Saltzman, “Transnational Indigenous Exchange”; Deloria, *Indians in Unexpected Places*; Vizenor, “Aesthetics of Survivance”; Mithlo, *Knowing Native Arts*; Lonetree, *Decolonizing Museums*.

16. Stoler, *Along the Archival Grain*. See also Schweitzer and Henry, *Afterlives of Indigenous Archives*.

17. Papafava, *Vatican*, 44.
18. "Ethnological Museum Anima Mundi," Vatican Museums, accessed February 6, 2024, <https://www.museivaticani.va/content/museivaticani/en/collezioni/musei/museo-etnologico/museo-etnologico.html>.
19. Fabian, *Time and the Other*, 91.
20. Meetings with conservator, American Academy in Rome, February, and March 2022.
21. Cole, *Performance*.
22. My usage of the term *stolen treasures* is inspired by Lou-ann Neel's practice as a Kwakwaka'wakw artist and museum specialist. See also the interdisciplinary symposium, "Restitution Dialogues: Exploring the Vatican Archives," University of Toronto, Faculty of Law, January 18, 2023; see <https://www.law.utoronto.ca/events/restitution-dialogues-exploring-vatican-archives>.
23. I am one of a number of scholars from across the Americas and Europe who have been refused access to the archives and collections of the Ethnological Museum *Anima Mundi*. Conversation with Alison Kahn, anthropologist, Rome, November 2016, and ongoing correspondence. I was also a recipient of a letter that further outlines the Ethnological Museum's colonial dynamics: "In contrast to what Dr. Bell reports, I have had welcome access as a nonindigenous researcher to these collections and their records." Letter copied to the author, March 2022.
24. Pohlandt-McCormick, "In Good Hands," 316. She expands on her fieldwork, "As I focused my topic and placed it in the time of the Soweto Uprising of June 16, 1976, I came up against what, at the time, seemed like the intransigent barriers of the South African archival system and the laws that—not unlike those in other countries—prevented insight into documents younger than thirty years. It was clear that the archives were also rooted in a historical context and reflected the conventions and habits of the apartheid past as much as the rapid pace of historical change in South Africa during the 1990s." Pohlandt-McCormick, "In Good Hands," 303.
25. Historian Jace Weaver notes that "by the grace of God and declaration of the Holy Pontiff, Indians were found to possess divine souls and were thus eligible for salvation." Weaver, *Native American Religious Identity*, 22.
26. "Pope Inspects Exhibition," 5.
27. Ghosh et al., *Archive Stories*, 10.
28. The Propaganda Fide Library now holds many Indigenous-language books taken by missionaries for the VME.
29. Todd and Fraser, "Decolonial Sensibilities."
30. McMaster and Martin, "Introduction," 11.
31. For more of the altered photographs, please see my research newsletter; see access information at <https://www.mcgill.ca/ahcs/people-contacts/faculty/gloria-bell>.

32. Sweet, "Reimagining the African-Atlantic Archive." See also Gell, "Vogel's Net."
33. Derrida, *Archive Fever*.
34. See "The Pope Has a Rare Antique Kayak and Many More Indigenous Artifacts Hidden away in the Vatican Museums," *Globe and Mail*, November 31, 2021, <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/world/article-the-pope-has-a-rare-antique-kayak-and-many-more-indigenous-artifacts/>; and Testore, "L'Evangelizzazione degli Esquimesi."
35. I recently participated in an interdisciplinary symposium about the Vatican's nonresponse to restitution: "Restitution Dialogues: Exploring the Vatican Archives," University of Toronto, Faculty of Law, January 18, 2023; <https://www.law.utoronto.ca/events/restitution-dialogues-exploring-vatican-archives>.
36. Throughout the text I will refer to Edmonia Lewis as Anishinaabe and/or Ojibwe. Both are acceptable terminology and also represent the complexity and importance of naming for Indigenous artists. See Buffalo, "Knowing All My Names"; Buick, "Ideal Works."
37. Vimalassery, Pegues, and Goldstein, "Colonial Unknowing," 1042.
38. See Aigner et al., *The Americas*.
39. The leaflet headline is "I pochi Aborigeni che rimangono ancora in Australia" (The few Aboriginals that still remain in Australia). For more on Fernando, see Paisley, *Lone Protester*.

CHAPTER 1. UNSETTLING THE INDIAN MUSEUM IN ROME

1. Richard Payne Knight wrote about West's experience in a footnote to a poem entitled "The Landscape: A Didactic Poem in Three Books" (1794). See fuller discussion in Pratt, *American Indians*, 22–23.
2. Historian Marilyn Richardson notes that Lewis garnered permission to sketch at the Vatican collections. Richardson, "Friends and Colleagues," 104. For more about Canova, see Honour, "Canova's Studio Practice I" and "Canova's Studio Practice II."
3. Salenius, "Introduction," 16; "Personal" (1870).
4. Curator Jacqueline Copeland discovered this *carte de visite* of Lewis, and it is now in the collection of the Walters Art Museum, Baltimore.
5. Lewis received a papal blessing for her work. See James, James, and Boyer, *Notable American Women*, 398.
6. "An interesting novelty has sprung up amongst us, in a city where all our surroundings are of the olden time. Miss Edmonia Lewis, a lady of color, has taken a studio in Rome, and works as a sculptress." Wreford, "Negro Sculptress." See also Tufts, "Edmonia Lewis."
7. Nelson, *Color of Stone*, 180.
8. Nelson, *Color of Stone*, 180.