Rachel Douglas

MAKING *THE BLACK JACOBINS*

C. L. R. JAMES AND THE DRAMA OF HISTORY

MAKING

THE BLACK JACOBINS

THE C. L. R. JAMES ARCHIVES

DUKE UNIVERSITY PRESS

MAKING
THE BLACK JACOBINS

C. L. R. James and the Drama of History

RACHEL DOUGLAS

DUKE UNIVERSITY PRESS DURHAM AND LONDON 2019

Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper ∞
Designed by Amy Ruth Buchanan
Typeset in Arno Pro and Gill Sans Std.
by Westchester Publishing Services

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Names: Douglas, Rachel, [date] author.
Title: Making the Black Jacobins : the drama of C. L. R. James's history / Rachel Douglas.
Description: Durham : Duke University Press, 2019. | Series: The C. L. R. James archives | Includes bibliographical references and index.
Identifiers: LCCN 2019002423 (print)
LCCN 2019009129 (ebook)
ISBN 9781478005308 (ebook)
ISBN 9781478004271 (hardcover : alk. paper)
ISBN 9781478004875 (pbk. : alk. paper)
Subjects: LCSH: James, C. L. R. (Cyril Lionel Robert), 1901–1989. Black Jacobins. | James, C. L. R. (Cyril Lionel Robert), 1901–1989—Criticism and interpretation. | Toussaint Louverture, 1743–1803. | Haiti—History—Revolution, 1791–1804.
Classification: LCC F1923 (ebook) | LCC F1923 .D684 2019 (print) | DDC 972.94/03—dc23
LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019002423

Cover art: Édouard Duval-Carrié, *Le Général Toussaint Enfumé*, 2001.
© Édouard Duval-Carrié. Courtesy of Rum Nazon, Cap Haïtien.

DUKE
UNIVERSITY
PRESS

THIS BOOK IS DEDICATED TO

CATRIONA AND LEILA

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book is based on research conducted in Trinidad and New York funded by a British Academy Small Research Grant (SG-51932) and a Small Research Grant from the Carnegie Trust for the Universities of Scotland. The book was written while I was in receipt of an Arts and Humanities Research Council Early-Career Fellowship (AH/I002662/1). I gratefully acknowledge the support of the AHRC, the British Academy, and the Carnegie Trust. During the project, I moved to the University of Glasgow from the University of Liverpool, and I would like to thank colleagues at both institutions for their contributions, especially Charles Forsdick, Michael Syrotinski, and Jackie Clarke.

In addition to the AHRC and the universities of Glasgow and Liverpool, I am very grateful to the following organizations for their assistance with the October 2013 conference, *The Black Jacobins* Revisited: Rewriting History: International Slavery Museum, National Museums Liverpool, the Bluecoat, Society for the Study of French History, Association for the Study of Modern and Contemporary France, Society for French Studies, Royal Historical Society, Alliance Française de Glasgow, and the Haiti Support Group. Participants at that event, including the keynote speakers Yvonne Brewster, Selwyn R. Cudjoe, Rawle Gibbons, Robert A. Hill, Selma James, Nick Nesbitt, and Matthew J. Smith, made invaluable contributions to C. L. R. James scholarship there.

This book has been a long time in the making and many people have collaborated with me to help bring it to fruition. To each of the following people I owe more than I can say, and so let me warmly thank David Abdullah, Michel Acacia, Katie Adams, Foz Allan, Tayo Aluko, Adisa "Aja" Andwele, Yoshio Aoki, A. James Arnold, David Austin, David A. Bailey, Martin Banham, Aisha Baptiste, Carla Bascombe, Madison Smartt Bell, Anthony Bogues,

Sergio Bologna, Yvonne Brewster, Hans-Christoph Buch, Margaret Busby, Jhon Picard Byron, Raj Chetty, Sandro Chignola, Rocky Cotard, Selwyn R. Cudjoe, Raphael Dalleo, Claudy Delné, Mike Dibb, Ceri Dingle, Farrukh Dhondy, Marilyn Dunn, Natalia Ely, Laurent Dubois, Grant Farred, David Featherstone, Kate Ferris, Charles Forsdick, Maria Cristina Fumagalli, Ferruccio Gambino, Marvin George, Rawle Gibbons, Corey Gilkes, Maurisa Gordon-Thompson, Katie Gough, Donna Hall-Commissiong, Emma Hart, Leila Hassan, Kathleen Helenese-Paul, Yuko Hirono, Kate Hodgson, Raphael Hoermann, Christian Høgsbjerg, Sean Jacobs, Selma James, Ulrick Jean-Pierre, Kwynn Johnson, Aaron Kamugisha, Rochelle Kapp, Louise Kimpton-Nye, Kwame Kwei-Armah, Jean-Pierre Le Glaunec, Adrian Leibowitz, Hongling Liang, Rosa López Oceguera, Filippo del Lucchese, Danielle Lyndersay, Roy McCree, Peter D. McDonald, Llewellyn McIntosh (Short Pants), F. Bart Miller, Lukanyo Mnyanda, Sumita Mukherjee, Jenny Morgan, Stephen Mullen, Martin Munro, Philip Murray (Black Sage), Lorraine Nero, Nick Nesbitt, Aldon Lynn Nielsen, Tadgh O'Sullivan, Raffaele Petrillo, Bryony Randall, Ciraj Rassool, Alan Rice, David Rudder, Marina Salandy-Brown, Catherine Spencer, Corinne Sandwith, Bill Schwarz, Marika Sherwood, Richard Small, Andy Smith, Matthew J. Smith, Terry Stickland, Patrick Sylvain, Glenroy Taitt, Afonso Teixeira Filho, Harclyde Walcott, Elizabeth Walcott-Hackshaw, Ozzi Warwick, Zoë Wilcox, and Eugene Williams. Without their generous help, none of this would ever have been possible.

Frank Rosengarten, Darcus Howe, and Dapo Adelugba, who all contributed to this project, sadly died before the book was finished. Robert A. Hill, C. L. R. James's literary executor and close associate, shared his unparalleled extensive knowledge of James's life and work. After my own two trips to the C. L. R. James Papers archive at Columbia University, New York, Jeremy Glick was an enormous help with archival research assistance. There could not have been a better-qualified navigator of that archive. I appreciate how quickly he stepped into the breach when some archive photos were lost. I am forever indebted to Rianella Gooding for taking such good photographs of James's open-book gravestone in Tunapuna cemetery, Trinidad, for me at short notice. Very special thanks to three people in Barbados—Alissandra Cummins, William St. James Cummins, and Anderson Toppin—who moved heaven and earth at short notice to take a high-resolution photo of Ras Akyem-i Ramsay's artwork. Many thanks to the artist Édouard Duval-Carrié, and to the owners Rum Nazon, Cap-Haïtien for allowing me to use the 2001 portrait of *Le Général Toussaint enfumé* (General Toussaint wreathed

in smoke) for the cover. This directly James-inspired artwork reclaims *The Black Jacobins* for the land of its inspiration: Haiti. Warm thanks also go to Ramsay, Kimathi Donkor, Lubaina Himid, and the Middlesbrough Institute of Modern Art for granting me permission to reproduce their artworks in the following pages.

Most of the actual writing of this book happened at the National Library of Scotland, Edinburgh. Staff there and at the interlibrary loans department at Glasgow University Library were very efficient and enabled me to access many rare documents. Librarians and archivists from around the world have provided me with an abundance of rare materials about C. L. R. James. I would particularly like to thank staff in special collections departments at the University of the West Indies, St. Augustine, Trinidad; Columbia University, New York; the Walter P. Reuther Library of Wayne State University, Detroit, Michigan; the Tamiment Library of New York University Library and the Oral History of the American Left materials set up by Paul Buhle and Jonathan Bloom; the Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture in New York City; the Penn State University Libraries; the Moorland-Spingarn Research Center at Howard University, Washington, DC; the Errol Hill Papers at Dartmouth College, New Hampshire; the Richard Wright Papers at the Beinecke Library, Yale University; the Sir Learie Constantine Collection, National Library Information Services (NALIS), Trinidad; the Andrew Salkey Archive, British Library; the Quinton O'Connor Memorial Library, Oilfield Workers' Trade Union (OWTU), San Fernando, Trinidad; the Institute of Commonwealth Studies, Senate House Library, University of London; Glasgow Caledonian University Archive of the Trotskyist Tradition, Glasgow; the Talawa Theatre Company Papers at the Victoria and Albert Theatre and Performance Archives, London; and the Labour History Archive and Study Centre, Manchester.

Thanks to editor Gisela Concepción Fosado and to everyone at Duke University Press for their support. I am grateful to the readers for their incisive and thought-provoking comments. A different version of sections of chapter 4 appeared in *The Black Jacobins Reader*, edited by Charles Forsdick and Christian Høgsbjerg (2017). I acknowledge the permission given by the editors and Duke University Press to draw on the material in the context of this broader analysis.

I would like to thank my family, especially Stephen—my first reader—who has been so supportive of this project, who has lived with the book for a long time, and who has gone out of his way to help at every stage of the

process. This book is dedicated to Catriona and Leila, who arrived during the book's making. Both have been very patient while I have been working on the mysterious book. They both probably know a great deal now about C. L. R. James, *The Black Jacobins*, and the Haitian Revolution, as these were subjects of conversation in our house for so long. Their drawings and doodles often adorned many of the pages as I was writing them. I hope that one day soon they too will read and discover *The Black Jacobins* for themselves.

INTRODUCTION

There is no drama like the drama of history.
—C. L. R. James, *The Black Jacobins*

If there is no drama like the drama of history, according to C. L. R. James himself, what was the role of actual drama in shaping his own accounts of the Haitian Revolution across versions of *The Black Jacobins*? This question guides the present book, which takes James's own representation of the past of the Haitian Revolution as drama into account by examining both his plays, *Toussaint Louverture* in 1936 and *The Black Jacobins* in 1967. Clichés about links between drama and history abound. References to the drama of history, the great drama of a revolution, and descriptions of historical characters as tragic protagonists on the stage of world history are commonplace. Publisher Secker and Warburg's 1938 advertisement for *The Black Jacobins* referred once to "romance" and twice to "drama": "The romance of a great career and the drama of revolutionary history are combined in CLR JAMES' magnificent biography of TOUSSAINT LOUVERTURE. [. . .] The drama of his career is here brilliantly described in a narrative which grips the attention."[1] But beyond such analogies where historical events can be said to resemble drama, what happens when the past is actually turned into drama?

Making The Black Jacobins*: C. L. R. James and the Drama of History* charts the trajectory of C. L. R. James's multiple engagements with the Haitian Revolution throughout his lifetime, including his pioneering history *The Black Jacobins*. By uncovering the mobile and organic transformations of *The Black Jacobins* in both its theatrical and historiographical versions, this book illuminates the genesis and evolution of James's Haitian Revolution–related writing over a period of almost sixty years, from the 1930s to his death in 1989. *The Black Jacobins* is shown in chapter 5 on future directions to

have lived on in a series of afterlives where others have made the work speak to new circumstances and issues in their turn.

The Black Jacobins is one of the great works of the twentieth century and remains today the cornerstone of Haitian Revolutionary studies. *Making* The Black Jacobins investigates the complex transformations through which the work came to be, via the first comparisons of the two plays and two versions of the history, while taking the reader on a tour of the significant paratexts—book covers, interviews, talks, and reviews—that document the work's multiple becomings. This book investigates the vital significance of *The Black Jacobins* as a work of history and of theater by bringing the revisions and their meanings to the attention of general readers of James. It is based on discussion of hitherto all but completely neglected manuscripts of James's first and second plays, and his correspondence about these plays and history editions, together with special attention to the ways in which James rewrote and rethought *The Black Jacobins* history over the course of his life in many different contexts and periods. The book surveys for the first time in its entirety the history of James's masterpiece and its transformations as history and play. As a whole, *Making* The Black Jacobins compares and contrasts the changing historiographic narrative with the relative freedom of theater to refashion understanding of the revolution, in the absence of any conclusive documentation in the historical archive.

Despite its importance as the classic history of the Haitian Revolution, there is relatively little knowledge of the eventful history of *The Black Jacobins* itself, and of key changes made by James and others, both during and after the author's lifetime. Rewriting—the subject of this book—links James's topic, his writing methods, and the events of the Haitian Revolution. James's history helped to change the way colonial history was written from presenting the colonized as passive objects to active subjects. Added to this, James kept telling and retelling how the Haitian Revolution rewrote world history as the first and only slave revolution to fight against the great powers of the day and win.

Rewriting, it will be argued, is an important part of James's working methods from the beginning and throughout his whole career. James's other early rewritten works include *The Life of Captain Cipriani* (1932) and *The Case for West Indian Self-Government* (1933), with the condensed latter title cutting out most of the biographical material about the Trinidad labor leader Cipriani.[2] *Mariners, Renegades, and Castaways: The Story of Herman Melville and the World We Live In* (1953) was first privately published by James in a bid to

appeal against deportation from the United States, with a copy sent to every member of Congress. Its evolution saw James rewrite one chapter and cut out another.[3] James also rewrote *A History of Negro Revolt*, first published in 1938, publishing it again in 1969 with a new title—*A History of Pan-African Revolt*—and an extra epilogue, focusing like the 1963 *Black Jacobins* history revisions on bringing the 1938 history up to date.[4] Other slight changes were made to that text when James was revising it, including the removal of references to Franco's Moors.[5] However, there were also occasions when not a single word was changed. *World Revolution*, for example, was first published in 1937 and later reprinted unchanged in 1973.[6] Another updated statement was James's pamphlet *State Capitalism and World Revolution*, which went through four editions during James's lifetime: 1950, 1956, 1968, and 1984.[7] In this way, other works too, beyond *The Black Jacobins*, were reshaped by James during his lifetime and reframed in order to respond to new circumstances across the world.

This book is about the nature and significance of changes throughout James's Haitian Revolution writings from the 1930s up to his death in 1989, and beyond. James was, above all, a profoundly political person. In a 1980 interview, he said he wanted to be remembered as one of the important Marxists for his serious contributions to Marxism.[8] This book examines what happens as James keeps traveling further along the road of *The Black Jacobins* in his Haiti-related writing. From the start, James's writings about the Haitian Revolution can be thought of as reworking Marxism and Trotsky's notion of permanent revolution. Examining James's Haiti-related writings, the book reads the changes as reflections of James's own political evolution. It is productive to think of the different history editions, plays, and articles as drafts or working documents, offered up for discussion and further elaboration by James's political groups. Looking at what changes over time also allows us to chart James's serious and original contributions to Marxism through the prism of his Haiti-related works.

The Black Jacobins must be read alongside James's defining political experiences and the great strides in terms of Marxist theory and practice made in America from the 1940s onward. Under the pseudonym J. R. Johnson, James was organizing a political group in the United States from the early 1940s onward, which became known as the Johnson-Forest Tendency. This was formed of a small core, including Raya Dunayevskaya, originally from Russia, one of Trotsky's secretaries, and whose pseudonym "Freddie Forest" became part of the group's name. There was also Grace Lee, a Chinese American who

had studied German and helped the group to study Marx's writings from the original German, while Dunayevskaya enabled them to study other Marxist works from the original Russian.[9] Increasingly, James and his group drew attention to the spontaneous self-activity of the masses and to more popular alternative leaders.

While *The Black Jacobins* is famed as the classic history of the Haitian Revolution, the trajectory of James's wider Haitian Revolution–related writings also includes two plays that bookend the two editions of the more celebrated history. It is crucial to study these plays in conjunction with the history versions because they give us some of the first and last words on the Haitian Revolution, according to James. The 1936 performance of the first play, *Toussaint Louverture*, antedates the initial 1938 publication of the history *The Black Jacobins* by two years, while the second play, *The Black Jacobins* (1967) comes more than four years after the revision of the history for its second 1963 edition. The script for the 1936 play *Toussaint Louverture*—previously feared by many to have been lost for good—has only recently been published, thanks to Christian Høgsbjerg's 2013 critical edition. Surprisingly, less seems to be known about the 1967 play *The Black Jacobins* than would be expected, despite the script for this second play appearing twice in print and being performed across a number of countries over the decades since its December 14–16, 1967, premiere by the Arts Theatre Group, University of Ibadan, Nigeria.

Theater occupies a special place in this study, especially the connection between the activities of doing theater and doing politics. Theater can be thought of as politics-ready, and James's use of theater's specific political qualities is examined, including its potential to propose alternatives to the present realities, to show people images of themselves through live performance, and to perform revolution in action.[10] Drama has further advantages for representing the past, which will be explored, including dialogic drama's multivoicedness, enabling alternative characters, of whom there is little archival trace, to speak more audibly and to take center stage.[11]

The final section addresses the afterlives of *The Black Jacobins*, including key translations, monuments and exhibitions dedicated to James, and the trajectory of his Haitian Bible in Haiti itself, the country of James's inspiration, and across other political situations including apartheid South Africa. The book ends by examining how *The Black Jacobins* is a book always kept open by others beyond James himself, with multiple components of *The Black Jacobins* acting as a guide and catalyst for political action.

Rethinking the Rethinking: Work on James and *The Black Jacobins*

Across the wealth and breadth of existing scholarship on James, it is striking how many prominent references there are, often even in titles, to the need to rethink James, *The Black Jacobins*, and the audacity of his achievements.[12] This book builds on Susan Gillman's conceptualization of *The Black Jacobins* as a "text-network," which she expresses as an equation: "from Columbus to Toussaint + Toussaint to Castro = from Columbus to Castro," arguing that the resulting revised edition of James's history even outdoes Eric Williams's 1970 book by the same title.[13] To this equation, I would add that *The Black Jacobins* is always already itself more than the sum of its parts: a constantly changing whole with shifting coordinates, which grows in size as James continues to relocate and reorient his most famous work. Already the history in itself is a text-network, if we look beyond the history to consider the multiple versions and revisions of the different editions and sprawling drafts of the two plays, which multiply, becoming even more multilayered as the coordinates of the protean *Black Jacobins* text-network shift.

David Scott's groundbreaking study *Conscripts of Modernity* (2004) has analyzed a number of key additions to the 1963 revised edition of the history. His interpretations are based largely on one set of added paragraphs as Scott reads through James's *Black Jacobins* to make wider arguments about the romance of anticolonial pasts and the tragedy of postcolonial presents/futures. This project tries to fill the gap, which Scott himself acknowledges, namely telling the story of the actual writing of *The Black Jacobins*—a story that, Scott indicates, urgently needs to be told. This book takes his analysis of anticolonial pasts and postcolonial presents/futures in new directions, both forward and backward across the writing of *The Black Jacobins*, including the plays. This book also builds on studies of James's plays by Nicole King, Frank Rosengarten, and Reinhard Sander, which all predate Høgsbjerg's discovery and publication of the Hull manuscript of the first play, *Toussaint Louverture*, and which make astute observations about James's playwriting based on published versions of the second play, *The Black Jacobins*, from 1976 and 1992.[14] Here all the versions of the plays and history are compared for the first time.[15]

Palimpsests, Paratexts, and Methods

This book argues that *The Black Jacobins* should be seen as a palimpsest with its successive layers of rewriting as it reuses the same story of the Haitian

Revolution for different purposes: articles, plays, histories. Resembling a palimpsest, James's multiple text-network related to Haiti contains manuscript inscriptions where new writing is superimposed on top of previous writing, often leaving behind visible traces of the rewriting. My case for calling *The Black Jacobins* a palimpsest is strengthened by James's own conviction that his 1938 history's "foundation would remain imperishable."[16] It is the very fact that the vast bulk of the history itself remains unchanged for the subsequent editions that makes it a palimpsest. Palimpsests are layered repositories of embedded vestiges, meaning that earlier inscriptions remain and are never erased, because "these narrative inscriptions become part of the whole."[17]

French narratologist Gérard Genette's famous work *Palimpsestes* is centered on his notion of hypertextuality, whereby a later text (the hypertext) grafts itself palimpsestually onto a hypotext, an earlier text that it transforms.[18] Such transformative visions of palimpsests/rewriting underpin my book, as do Genette's theories of paratexts or textual outsides—everything connected with the book that is not the text proper.[19] For this study, it is sometimes necessary to judge the works in question by their covers, and their prefaces, notes, appendixes, epilogues, and bibliographies, which James uses to reframe his Haiti-related work throughout its long evolution. While Genette's work on palimpsests and paratexts is very usable for this book, it is also necessary to break with his decontextualized, inward-looking approaches to textuality, and with his rigid typologies of hypertextuality and paratexts. Such approaches need to be adapted and decolonized to look outward at the political contexts that are so important to a fundamentally political person like James.[20]

For my examination of the making of *The Black Jacobins*, materialist methodologies for tracking manuscript and textual versions from genetic criticism and book history have also been useful. Book history offers methods for analyzing the material aspects of a book's construction—be that its cover, format, packaging, or typography—and the circumstances of literary production, dissemination, and reception. Traditionally, book history's methodologies have been applied primarily by those working on the medieval and early modern periods, with scholarly attention to postcolonial and modern book history still in its infancy.[21] Inspired by perspectives from book history, I pay closer attention to the material conditions of textual production, transmission, and reception of *The Black Jacobins* throughout its long genesis.

Where methods are concerned, the book seeks to decolonize genetic criticism and to build on the postcolonial genetic criticism established by

Richard Watts, A. James Arnold, and others. The book attempts to look both backward to investigate the complex genesis of these texts and also, crucially, beyond the dominant genetic paradigm, refusing the fetishization of the earliest beginnings that can mar works of genetic criticism, which sometimes pay little attention to what happens after publication.[22] *Making* The Black Jacobins also looks forward beyond initial publication to consider the impacts, the becomings, and afterlives of James's magnum opus. This results in a type of genetic criticism that tries to be politically informed and forward-looking, as befits one of the greatest and most original thinkers of the Marxist tradition.

With genetic criticism, the genetics in question are those of manuscripts.[23] Genetic criticism is a youngish, predominantly French phenomenon that offers a method for reading and ordering all drafts of a literary work intelligibly and is concerned with the genealogies of its textual beginnings. It offers a useful model for approaching the dynamics of the long genesis and evolution of James's plays and history based on the Haitian Revolution. On theater, genetic criticism sheds invaluable light on the many layers that make up the creative process of writing the plays in particular.[24] Specifically, I have used genetic criticism methods for performing archival work and establishing the relative chronology of all the manuscripts and typescripts consulted for both the 1936 *Toussaint Louverture* and the 1967 *Black Jacobins* plays.

These genetic criticism and book history approaches have been fruitful for illuminating the plays' geneses from new angles, and have formed a useful theoretical framework for approaching and making sense of all the play drafts. Genetic criticism involves a search for origins, and empirically genetic criticism and book history typologies try to set themselves apart from the traditional domain of literary criticism by stressing the material dimension of the work at hand. This is a genetic field that seeks archival reality based on more materially concrete empirical evidence. Genetic criticism has given me a how-to guide with which to document the handling of archive boxes, folders, and their dusty contents, fragile manuscript and onionskin typescript pages, the examination of every blot and mark, and even analysis of various paper and notebook types. How-to guides by Almuth Grésillon and others have helped me to work out the relative chronologies of drafts.[25] *Avant-texte* is the central notion around which genetic criticism revolves. It is often translated into English as pre-text or genetic dossier, or indeed the term can be left in French. Protocols elaborated by genetic critics dictate how to put archival documentation into a readable and intelligible form. The avant-texte or genetic dossier chronologically works out the various stages as the writing

progresses from first manuscript or typescript draft to last, before publication of the book proper.

For my analysis of the evolution of James's *Black Jacobins* project, empirical work on variants is only ever a means to an end. In the case of the *Toussaint Louverture* and *The Black Jacobins* plays, I have sought at a preliminary stage of my work to establish the relative chronology of all the scripts consulted. But the cataloging of variants in their own right is not the aim of this book. Rather, establishing all the different versions of the typescripts and of the published texts themselves has been the essential first stage of my research, providing a more authoritative basis from which to develop wider points about James's *Black Jacobins*. Genetic criticism and book history methodologies have certainly been enabling for reconstructing and clarifying the complex story of *The Black Jacobins* throughout the decades, which is the aim of this book.

Trying to make genetic criticism and book history methodologies talk to a work like *The Black Jacobins* has led me to think about the problems and unacknowledged assumptions of these models. Hallmarks of genetic criticism that I found rather alien to James's *Black Jacobins* project included the method's usually narrow French-Francophone application—a type of genetics that, despite its major impact in France, has not traveled so well to other countries outside its *appellation d'origine contrôlée*. It is also important to think about changes made after first publication of works like *The Black Jacobins*. Genetic criticism rarely pays attention to the trajectory of a work after first publication. Traditionally, there has been a strict cutoff point between the manuscript pre-text and the published text, with the latter normally seen as fixed, and variants studied only up to the point of publication.[26] As will be shown, however, the published form of *The Black Jacobins* is never fixed. Here, I use genetic criticism's methods to read variants across published versions of the work too.

Recently, considerable strides have been made to widen the scope of genetic criticism beyond France, to Francophone authors and to literature written in other languages from elsewhere. For instance, 2011 saw the publication of an important collection of genetic criticism on works by African and Caribbean writers. This was a special issue, "Afrique–Caraïbe," of the official journal *Genesis*, of genetic criticism's Paris-based institutional home: the Institut des textes et manuscrits modernes (ITEM).[27] Prior to this publication in 2011, geneticist readings of Francophone literature had been given a platform within ITEM when in 2009 a team dedicated to the Francophone

manuscript was set up, embarking on a bimonthly seminar program from which many of the *Genesis* articles took shape. Since then, the group now has shifted its focus toward the global south.

This work by the Francophone subsection of ITEM in Paris is a key reference point for my work. Recently, the scope of genetic criticism has been widened in new thematic directions, such as theater, autobiography, letter writing, and photography. Further afield, the emphasis has occasionally been on a particular geographical location (Argentina, Russia), or a language (Hispanic), but the Francophone manuscript focus entrenches the monolingualism of genetic criticism. Such a Francocentric approach could divide James's *Black Jacobins* in English from the likes of Aimé Césaire and his *Cahier d'un retour au pays natal*, another work with a long genesis, and one on which James would explicitly comment at length in the 1963 added appendix to his history.

For all genetic criticism's supposedly empirical focus and archive-driven preoccupation with materially concrete manuscript evidence and solid documentation, the reality sought here is an archival one: that of the manuscripts themselves. Manuscripts are usually considered separately from the finished published text. Genetic criticism often bypasses and eliminates political contexts, folding back instead on the materiality of the manuscripts themselves, and not on what is taking place in the world at large. Left out of this genetic criticism approach is the all-important relay binding together the work of a politically driven Marxist like James and the genesis of *The Black Jacobins* play drafts: political matters.

New perspectives from genetic criticism devoted specifically to theatrical genesis have been most usable for my purposes.[28] When applied to the theater, genetic criticism provides antidotes to that old cliché that a play's text is a dead corpse, while its performance is a living, vital body. Performance studies focuses almost exclusively on the finished play as performed to audiences, neglecting creative preparatory work leading up to that moment. While theater genetics claims to focus on the interplay between page and stage, what is indisputable is that the textual pole remains dominant despite claims to the contrary. But genetic criticism's textual focus usefully highlights the crucial role played in theatrical productions by written materials of all kinds, and this has helped me to make the most of all the written vestiges directly connected to the genesis of the play texts and performances.

Drafts of James's Haitian Revolution writings are scattered throughout the world in archives, libraries, and private collections, with the most important

holdings at the University of the West Indies, Trinidad, and at Columbia University in New York. Clearly, this scattering of scripts is a result of James's usual collaborative working methods, whereby he would have copies typed, annotate them, and then send them to comrades around the world for political discussion and feedback. This was particularly the case after James's deportation from the United States in 1953. Around that time, his political organization regrouped in Detroit and became known as the Correspondence publishing group, with correspondence being the main method of their political collaborations.

The French-Francophone genetic criticism model needs to be decolonized, broadened, and politicized in order to confront works like *The Black Jacobins*. This is a work that does not revel in the pleasures of the pre-text or aesthetics for their own sake. Instead, James's Haitian Revolution–related writings are written from a strongly Marxist point of view and guided by clear political ideas regarding the Caribbean region, the United States, Europe, and Africa, and by James's own political struggles and responses to the twentieth century's most significant events across the Caribbean and Africa.

James himself had definite plans for publication of these changes. As revealed in a commentary to an alternative scene of *The Black Jacobins* play, he intended to publish an edition of the play text that would provide a story of the making of the play, including the multiplication of alternative scenes and his own commentaries upon their significance.[29] Dexter Lyndersay, first director of *The Black Jacobins* play in 1967, gave James a concrete example of a similar venture as a possible model for the published edition of the play: William Gibson's *The Seesaw Log*.[30] Of course, neither of the two published versions of this play did demonstrate the crucial degree to which the play was reworked. But the fact that James wanted to preserve all these intermediate stages and their accompanying commentaries to the point where the various drafts of *The Black Jacobins* play would constitute a veritable palimpsest also bears witness to a large part of the work that is therefore deserving of more attention.

Theatrical genetic criticism sheds invaluable light on some of the multilayered activities that make up the creative process of writing the play while still in that transitional phase when it has not yet crystallized into final form. This theater subgenre of genetic criticism stresses most strongly the status of play drafts as perpetually unfinished and incomplete works. Nowhere, however, does this geneticist accent on the dynamism and openness of the theatrical work stress any properly political interpretations of such open charac-

teristics. Genetic criticism—even in its theatrical guise—remains strikingly apolitical.

On the unique relationship between radical politics and unfinished or incomplete dramatic works, Augusto Boal's *Theater of the Oppressed* is instructive.[31] If bourgeois theater can be thought of, after Boal, as finished theater, only presenting complacent images of the complete finished bourgeois world, then radical political theater of the left would by contrast reject any closed spectacles and always seek to enter into dialogue and ask for explanations. This idea provides a useful conceptual framework for reading James's sprawling and anarchic perpetual rewrites of material related to *The Black Jacobins*. The unfinished and open nature of the multiple drafts could be read as a type of handmaiden form for revolutionary theatrical and real-world processes of dynamic action, transformation, and re-creation where "theater is change and not simple presentation of what exists: it is becoming not being."[32] As a Marxist, playwright-activist James does theatrical work that can never be finished, nor ever end neatly and complacently in a state of serene repose. Instead, the open and unfinished form and contents of *The Black Jacobins* play drafts combine to reinforce the importance of hastening actual political and societal transformations, changes, transitions, political actions, and successful struggles for liberation. What is incomplete and unfinished here is political action and transformation.

Interviews: Rewriting the Death of the Author

To prepare for the writing of this book, I interviewed a number of people who were closely connected with James and *The Black Jacobins*, or with later incarnations of his 1967 play, including Selma James, C. L. R.'s widow; Robert A. Hill, C. L. R.'s literary executor; and directors of James's *Black Jacobins* play, including Yvonne Brewster, Rawle Gibbons, Eugene Williams, and Harclyde Walcott. Collaborators who were involved in various *Black Jacobins* translation projects have also been consulted, including Ferruccio Gambino, James's closest Italian comrade at the time of the 1968 Italian publication of *I Giacobini neri*, and Raffaele Petrillo, the actual translator, as well as Rosa López Oceguera, the Cuban translator of the eventual 2010 Casa de las Américas translation, about which James had been in talks since 1961. Also very useful have been interviews and records left by others, including James's great-nephew Darcus Howe and his widow and fellow Race Today Collective collaborator Leila Hassan, about a projected C. L. R. James Foundation

in London, for which the plans are among Darcus Howe's papers at Columbia University.

On the South African and Haitian contexts of the trajectory of *The Black Jacobins* throughout South Africa and Haiti, I have been privileged to speak to Sean Jacobs, Grant Farred, Lukanyo Mnyanda, Michel Hector, Michel Acacia, Jhon Picard Byron, and Claudy Delné. This has been very useful as it was impossible to give a prominent place to the explicit reception history because of a lack of reliable data for sales of *The Black Jacobins* in places like Haiti and apartheid South Africa. These interviews have helped me to approach the question of reception from a much broader perspective, similar to the approaches of Terence Cave and Ann Rigney in their studies of the afterlives of Mignon and Walter Scott.[33]

I also draw on James's own statements given during interviews and lectures, especially the series of lectures on *The Black Jacobins* that James delivered at the Institute of the Black World in Atlanta in 1971, but which have only recently been made widely available since their 2001 publication in the journal *Small Axe*.[34] One of these lectures, intriguingly titled "How I Would Rewrite *The Black Jacobins*" and delivered at the institute on June 18, 1971, is especially useful for my purposes. In this lecture, James reveals that he would only give Toussaint a walk-on part were he to rewrite *The Black Jacobins* again from scratch. But beyond the conditional of this snapshot of a hypothetical rewriting, it is important to recognize that James actually did reply to this key challenge of how to rewrite *The Black Jacobins* and that his stories of the Haitian Revolution responded with several different answers over a period of many decades. This type of source, as well as James's own autobiographical or programmatic statements, contained in the drafts of his unpublished autobiography or in author interviews during his lifetime, have given me extra authorial insights into the processes of making and remaking *The Black Jacobins*, which would not be available from any other kind of source.

Literary studies have generally followed Roland Barthes's famous declaration of the "death of the author" and his thorough discrediting of biographical-type criticism, where the author's general biography is linked to the meanings of the text.[35] This, according to Barthes, closed down the textual openness and meaning. The goal of this book is not to produce an excessively biographical account of *The Black Jacobins*. However, James as an author powerfully asserts and reasserts his ownership many times over the long genesis of his most famous work. With a political thinker and organizer like James, his own words and those of others close to his *Black Jacobins* proj-

ects need to be taken into account. I therefore want to make a special case against the death of the author and for considering the extratextual nature of James's real political life and declarations. Many studies of James have been based, quite rightly, on questions of his political biography. Attention turns here to the detail of James's writing, and it is necessary to tell a different story than the death of the author because, especially in the case of such a political person as James, his authorial voice simply cannot be banished from his own writing: we need the extratextual authorial voice to make sense of the work.

James writes the past of the Haitian Revolution as drama twice. Drama is a special literary category that offers a politics-ready representing machine for a fundamentally political person like James.[36] Theater is a showing form of historical representation where the audience is brought to witness the past and the future in the present, and where characters are given a voice of their own, with the drama acting as a sort of megaphone for James's political views.[37] Various reflections contained within drafts of the play also have James offering commentaries on his authorial choices as playwright.[38] James also revisions the past as history for the two 1938 and 1963 editions of his history. Where the story of the past of the Haitian Revolution is concerned, James turns to actual drama writing in addition to history writing. Especially when telling the past as history, James is an overt, controlling voice who self-consciously expresses his views on the action. Not taking his controlling historical voice into account is not an option, and this is why interviews and authorial statements and lectures form an important part of this book's methodology.

Relations between form and content and the varying generic forms in play are at the fore of this book's main concerns. In this respect, Hayden White offers a well-known paradigm concerning the history/literature debate. His narrativist approach to history stresses connections between history and fiction writing and similarities between fictive structuring processes of emplotment produced by both historians and fiction writers. David Scott's Hayden White–inspired reading of James's history revisions contrasts two modes of historical emplotment: the romance of the 1938 first edition of the history versus the emplotment of tragedy in the 1963 second edition. *The Black Jacobins* is always written and rewritten by James from an explicitly Marxist historical perspective. White's famous phrase "the content of the form" reflects on the formal characteristics of history and, above all, on its narrative quality.[39]

Genre is an important issue, and *The Black Jacobins* is notable for its distinctive crossover generic qualities.[40] This book tries to go beyond the distinctive literary feel of *The Black Jacobins* and to analyze its trajectory as actual drama and work of literature.[41] James himself spoke of a clear-cut distinction whereby between 1932 and 1938, "Fiction-writing drained out of me and was replaced by politics. I became a Marxist, a Trotskyist," and that "literature was vanishing from my consciousness and politics was substituting itself."[42] Fiction implies, however, a strong tendency to untruth, to make up something. This book pays attention to the special literary category that is drama, and to the particular crossover generic qualities it offers to a fundamentally political person like James.

So close is the relationship between theater and politics that they are often presented as going together hand in hand as second cousins. Theater has been described as the "most public of the arts," and as one of the arts of presentation/representation that, like photography, has a privileged access to truth.[43] This intrinsically political role of theater as a representing machine also strongly connects it with action, as long-dead characters and historical events from long ago can be brought to life by flesh-and-blood actors who perform these deeds in the present tense of theater's liveness, as if they were happening now. With pieces of political theater like *Toussaint Louverture* (1936) and *The Black Jacobins* (1967), the purpose is both to enact politics and revolution (depicting as it does the plight of the slaves/oppressed who fuel the capitalist economy and their revolution for changing the world) and to provoke the audience to do politics and revolution in their turn by resisting a state of affairs similar to the one resisted in the play. Turning the past back into drama again allows James to go further in showing peoples of African descent "taking action on a grand scale"—a key motivation behind his writing of *The Black Jacobins*, as stated clearly in his 1980 foreword to the history.[44]

Historiography of the Haitian Revolution

My reading of James's use of sources chimes with that of Bernard Moitt, who argues that James managed to reconstruct the world of the Haitian slaves, and in so doing "transcended linguistic and cultural frontiers in the historiography of the Caribbean."[45] This is certainly true, and *The Black Jacobins* itself is the result of James's extensive use and interpretation of French-language sources, including those of the earliest Haitian historians and those of his Haitian contemporaries in the early twentieth century.

James refers to the two early pillars of Haitian Revolution historiography: Thomas Madiou (1814–84) and Alexis Beaubrun Ardouin (1796–1865).[46] On Madiou, James indicates that this Haitian historian has given an outline of Moïse's alternative to his adoptive uncle Toussaint's program, although James also notes that its authenticity has been questioned. As for Ardouin, he poured his criticism on all dark-skinned leaders of the Haitian Revolution, including Toussaint, Dessalines, and Christophe, and attacked Madiou for being their apologist.[47] On Ardouin's six-volume study of Haitian history, James notes:

> Ardouin has written a very curious book. He is a Mulatto and hates Toussaint, hates the French (Roume, Sonthonax and all), and twists his evidence to suit his purpose. A Haitian scholar has informed the writer that he has detected Ardouin suppressing portions of letters which would prejudice the particular point he was proving. There is no reason to doubt this. Yet Ardouin has covered a great deal of ground. His hatred sharpens a remarkable acuteness and his book is one of the most valuable sources for any serious work on the San Domingo revolution.[48]

There are four references in total to Ardouin's history. James observes that these savage attacks are at the heart of Caribbean and Haitian historiography, and we will see that James's dialogic interventions on the Haitian Revolution also engage with these polemics.

For *The Black Jacobins*, there is one Haitian history that remains its most important source, and that is Horace Pauléus Sannon's three-volume *Histoire de Toussaint Louverture*, which is a homage to this Haitian revolutionary. Sannon (1870–1938) was the first president of the Haitian Société d'Histoire et de Géographie, which was founded by prominent intellectuals during the American occupation of Haiti in 1924. The histories of the society's founding president Sannon would be the strongest influence on James in the 1930s. In 2009, the president of that same Haitian Société d'Histoire et de Géographie called *The Black Jacobins* a "beacon of a book" for "a new approach to the revolution which emerges from the nation-state."[49] Back then in the 1920s, as first president of the society under the American occupation he vehemently opposed, Sannon explicitly set out the goals of the society's patriotic duty as to conjure up the past for reassurance, pride, and explanation of the present.[50] Most of all, James shares with Sannon his fundamental approach to the study of the revolution through the historical biography of Toussaint Louverture.

Sannon receives a grand total of fifteen references throughout *The Black Jacobins*, including a substantial in-text reference to his views on mixed-race mulattoes "as a typical intermediate class with all the political instability of that class" (230).[51] In this regard, James says, "No one has written more wisely and profoundly on the San Domingo revolution and Toussaint Louverture" than Sannon. A surprisingly short but decidedly positive reference is then made to Sannon in the annotated bibliography: "The best biography yet written of Toussaint" (383). James would follow Sannon by quite often letting Toussaint speak through his correspondence. Toussaint's letters as retranscribed by Sannon and Schœlcher thus occupy an important position in the *Black Jacobins* overall.

When looking at James's use of sources throughout *The Black Jacobins*, it is clear that, although he has consulted letters, reports, and other documents in the Paris archives, most of his sources are secondary ones.[52] He relies on the likes of nineteenth-century French abolitionist Victor Schœlcher's (1804–93) biography *La Vie de Toussaint-Louverture*, a work featuring extensive retranscriptions of Toussaint's letters.[53] James's history is heavily indebted to Schœlcher, more so than is acknowledged anywhere in the text, footnotes, and bibliography. One striking characteristic of James's Toussaint is that he is forever speaking in the first person directly out of the pages of his correspondence as mediated by Schœlcher. Such extensive first-person addresses already give James's history a distinctly dramaturgical feel, as if James is letting Toussaint speak for himself. There are nine references to Schœlcher in total, although the entry for him in James's annotated bibliography is decidedly wary: "Schœlcher is a French radical of the nineteenth century. He hates slavery, hates Bonaparte, and though his heart is in the right place, despite many shrewd comments, he is too uncritical to be trustworthy. But he has digested an enormous amount of original material of which he prints many extracts. All modern writers on the San Domingo revolution are indebted to him and his book should be read, although with extreme caution" (383).

On James's sources, Chris Bongie, Kirsten Silva Gruesz, and Susan Gillman have all pointed out that Pamphile de Lacroix's *Mémoires pour servir à l'histoire de la Révolution de Saint-Domingue* (1819) is of vital importance to the biographical portrait of Toussaint that James paints throughout *The Black Jacobins*.[54] If James's use of sources can be thought of as unsilencing the past by writing back to pernicious accounts and misrepresentations of the Haitian Revolution, James himself has been accused of silencing one source in particular: early Haitian historian Joseph Saint-Rémy (1815–58).

Marlene Daut has accused James of the "utterly myopic conclusion that Saint-Rémy hated Louverture 'like poison.'"[55] James can be thought of as silencing "a great deal of what Saint-Rémy actually wrote." Nick Nesbitt has argued that James should have followed French historian Albert Mathiez, who rehabilitated French revolutionary hero Robespierre. This would have stopped James from continuing to caricature Robespierre as some kind of "sinister dictator."[56]

An extremely important Haitian French-language source for James were the histories of Alfred Auguste Nemours (1883–1955), who was a Haitian general, diplomat, and military historian.[57] James and Nemours had actually met in Paris while James was doing research for *The Black Jacobins*. It was Nemours who opened his eyes to the military skills of revolutionary Haitians, as James would later recall in his 1980 foreword to the history (vi). Nemours receives fourteen references. Most of these references are, unsurprisingly, to be found in the two chapters—chapter 11, "The Black Consul," and chapter 13, "The War of Independence"—which deal most explicitly with Toussaint's military skills. Nemours was convinced that Haitians' military skills had been neglected by other historians, and that they were "additional proof of their humanity."[58] Nemours's blind admiration for Louverture has been criticized and was apparently such that Nemours sought to trace Toussaint's French descendants.[59] On Nemours, James's comments have been described as "very generous" when James describes Nemours as "an enthusiastic admirer of Toussaint but exceptionally fair" (382), and as "a great admirer of Toussaint" (308n15).[60] What James highlights as valuable is the fact that Nemours has "worked over the terrain" so carefully, with "extensive research among the archives in France," and his attentive studies of Toussaint's campaigns are commended. General Nemours is cited as the source who "has listed a mass of evidence on French military opinion of the great strength of the blacks at the time of submission" (327n26), underlining that Toussaint's strategy of submission was not because of imminent defeat by the French army. Nemours is credited with making several important documents linked to the Haitian Revolution more widely available; for example, James notes that Toussaint's "Constitution is printed in full in Nemours, *Histoire militaire* . . . , Vol. I, pp. 95–112" (263n20). Likewise, a note accompanying a long string of quotations from Leclerc's correspondence to Napoleon observes that Nemours has performed the task of retranscription on which *The Black Jacobins* is based: "Leclerc to the First Consul, February 9th, 1802. The letters retranscribed from the Archives of the Minister for War, by General Nemours.

See *Histoire Militaire de la Guerre d'Indépendence . . .* , Vol II, p. 53–120." Not always does James agree with Nemours on all points, but James weighs up all the issues from volume to volume of Nemours's multivolume work:

> General Nemours, a Haitian, a great admirer of Toussaint, and one who has made a careful study of this campaign, contradicts traditional Haitian history. He describes this battle as a defeat for Toussaint. But he bases his conclusions on, among other points, the supposed treachery of Maurepas. In Volume II of his work, however, he disproves the treachery of Maurepas, on evidence acquired after he had published Volume I. The result of the battle must for the time being remain undecided. See Nemours, *Histoire Militaire . . .* , Vol. I, pp. 210–211 and Vol. II, pp. 250–252. (308n15)

Apart from the many references to Nemours and Haitian Revolution military strategy as conveyed by Nemours's *Histoire Militaire*, James also singles out the importance of Nemours's *Histoire de la captivité et de la mort de Toussaint-L'Ouverture* (1929), although this book is not cited in his bibliography. The usefulness of this work of Nemours's is referenced in the footnotes as follows: "The definitive account of Toussaint's captivity with many of the most important documents printed in full" (363n78). From this note, it transpires that all the information on Toussaint's death in *The Black Jacobins* history, but particularly in the 1936 play *Toussaint Louverture* where it is a climactic scene, has come via Nemours.

Later, another new Haitian historian of importance for James would be Jean Fouchard, who established the Maroons—runaway slaves—as an important theme of Haitian historiography, making links between *marronage* and revolution.[61] James would later prove an important mentor to Fouchard's work, to which he would often make reference, as in his 1980 foreword to *The Black Jacobins* and drafts of his autobiography. James would also later present Fouchard's work to English readers when he was asked to write the preface to the 1981 English translation of Fouchard's book.[62]

What marks *The Black Jacobins* out from many previous non-Haitian histories of the revolution is the fact that it tells the story of the Haitian Revolution as a success—in fact, *The Story of the Only Successful Slave Revolt in History*, as the subtitle to James's first play, *Toussaint Louverture*, sums it up. As will be seen, at all points of their evolution—from article to play to history and back to play again—James's Haitian Revolution writings are profoundly dialogic. By uncovering the dialogic structure at the very heart of James's *Black Jacobins* project, we will see in the chapters that follow that James con-

structs his writing about the Haitian Revolution as a response to the denigrating representations of Toussaint and the revolution found in the likes of Sidney Harland, J. A. Froude, and T. Lothrop Stoddard. James will be seen to explicitly write back to these denigrating tales with his Haitian success story.

As an explicitly Marxist interpretation of the Haitian Revolution, it must also be acknowledged that James's 1938 history *The Black Jacobins* helped to alter standard Marxist historical explanations. Notably, James's 1938 work goes some way toward shifting the north-south Eurocentric view that revolution would occur first of all in Europe/advanced capitalist countries, and only subsequently thereafter would spread to the underdeveloped world.[63] And while it is true that the 1938 edition of *The Black Jacobins* ends with "let the blacks but hear from Europe the slogans of Revolution and the Internationale" (315), James does also indicate that revolution can be, and indeed already has been, initiated in colonized, underdeveloped parts of the world deemed backward according to the Marxist orthodoxy of the day, which expected backward colonial-type countries to follow the lead of the working classes in the most advanced countries. This idea is reworked in the 1938 history incarnation and is also developed later in the work's history, particularly in the light of James's elaboration, as part of the Johnson-Forest Tendency in the United States of the 1940s and early '50s, of his defining Marxist political positions. But already, from the very start of James's writings on this subject in the 1930s, the Haitian Revolution is held up as an alternative historical model for those in the colonized world, as a precursor to decolonization.

The Haitian Revolution (1791–1804) was the only successful slave-led revolt, one which inaugurated the first black republic and fundamentally reshaped the world historical map of the time. What links the subject of the revolution itself with James's pioneering *The Black Jacobins*, a work that revolutionized historiography, particularly that of the colonial world, is that both rewrite history from their very beginnings.[64] This is a rewriting project that then intensifies as it continues when James returns to his Haitian Revolution writings to rewrite them as history and as drama.

James and his historian descendants, including David Geggus and Laurent Dubois, have made much of the self-renaming and linguistic reshaping of the new world of Haitian independence.[65] Like the world of the French Revolution examined by Ronald Paulson, the Haitian Revolution renames a new revolutionary reality into being by imagining a radical break with the old contaminated lexicon of the colonial past, capable of resettling new

beginnings from a ground zero of history.[66] Accordingly, James and his scions have examined how autonomous new words and names are invented, through which to reshape linguistically the new world of independence. Greatest among these renamings, as analyzed by James and subsequent historians following his lead, is the choice by the former slaves of the new name of Haiti for the country—the indigenous name for the island—with which the old colonial European-bestowed relic "Saint Domingue" was replaced.[67] This revolutionary onomastic process of self-renaming has also been read by James and others as changing words and their meanings, as is also evident in the very language used in the Act of Haitian Independence.[68] Declared on a symbolic date for new beginnings—January 1, 1804—this key proclamation has been read by Laurent Dubois, after James, as even rewriting and overhauling the French language bequeathed to Haitians by their former colonial masters through the coining of new verbs including *lugubrer*—"to gloom"—from the French adjective *lugubre* (gloomy): "le nom français *lugubre* encore nos contrées" (The French name still glooms our lands).[69] There have been several interpretations of this verbal neologism of independence in the context of a document that its author, Haitian revolutionary Jean-Jacques Dessalines's secretary Louis Boisrond-Tonnerre, declared should be written on parchment made from the skin of a white man, with his skull as an inkwell, his blood as the ink, and a bayonet for a pen, with this symbolic dissection of the colonizer's body being read as the fiercest symbolic rejection of all things French.[70]

Marlene Daut has also examined how early Haitian memorialists, including Baron de Vastey and Boisrond-Tonnerre, used the colonizer's language to curse at the French, like Caliban in *The Tempest*, as they produced their own narratives of the Haitian Revolution as alternatives to those produced by the French.[71] Her work has uncovered how these early Haitian authors prevented the Haitian past from being silenced, rewriting the Haitian Revolution in their turn. Like Vastey and Boisrond-Tonnerre, James combats negative representations of Haiti and its revolution in accounts from Europe and the United States.

After James, several historians have pointed to the Haitian Revolution as the most radical statement of the overlapping ages of revolution and enlightenment, arguing that it should rightfully be seen at the center of both ages, and not silenced on their margins, as has often been the case.[72] During the Haitian Revolution, as James shows at length in his history and especially in his plays, former slaves reworked for themselves the banner words of the

Enlightenment/French Revolution idiom—words like freedom, equality, fraternity, and independence—reinterpreting such ideals within the framework of their own situation. Even the most enlightened of the Enlightenment thinkers advocated only a gradualist approach where slaves would gradually be prepared for abolition, with freedom something to be earned by deserving slaves, but also, most importantly, something to be granted benevolently by the colonial power of white abolitionists.[73] Instead, the Haitian Revolution is presented as a revolution of the slaves' own making; a self-emancipation. This is not, in other words, abolition as scripted by Europeans or Enlightenment thinkers. Rather, the radical antislavery of the Haitian Revolution is a story of major historical transformation of world importance where slaves vindicate themselves as active actors and as subjects of history in their own right; a vehement rejection of their condition as slaves—things, objects, and even "pieces of furniture" according to the *Code Noir*.[74] This inaugural self-fashioning that is the Haitian Revolution, whereby Haiti writes its own revolutionary agency, making its own history, thus already constitutes a radical rewriting of world history.

Central to the present study are the multiple layers of rewriting that intersect through the linchpin of these two bastions of historical significance: the Haitian Revolution and C. L. R. James's *Black Jacobins*. Rewriting is fundamentally linked with the practice of history in the Caribbean. From its first appearance, *The Black Jacobins* itself revolutionized the formation, scope, and perspective of historiography through its bold reinterpretation of events that themselves radically rewrote revolution and the world of Atlantic slaves. Where these rewriting layers—historical reshaping by the events of the Haitian Revolution and historiographical transformations inaugurated by *The Black Jacobins* and its rethinking of the history of the colonized world—come together most forcefully is in James's own extensive remaking of *The Black Jacobins* and in his reflections upon that long process of reconstruction itself. Chapter 2, "Making History," also probes James's collaboration with former protégé Eric Williams on ideas about capitalism and slavery.[75]

The 1949 French edition of *Les Jacobins noirs* gave a major historical boost to Haiti's celebrations of the *tricinquantenaire*—the 150th anniversary of the Haitian Revolution in 1954, only five years after this landmark publication. James had also hoped for his play *Toussaint Louverture* to be published by the same major French publisher, Gallimard, and he approached them about this in 1954, but to no avail. Around the time of the 1954 tricinquantenaire celebrations, James was also seriously planning to undertake a trip to Haiti

in 1957–58. Chapter 5, on the afterlives of *The Black Jacobins*, examines James's correspondence at the time with a number of key Haitian intellectuals, including writer Félix Morisseau-Leroy and historian Étienne Charlier, as well as senior Haitian government and embassy figures, dating from the beginning of the rule of François "Papa Doc" Duvalier. Historiographically, James's *Black Jacobins* had a real impact in its land of inspiration. As Michel-Rolph Trouillot has suggested, it opened up to Haitians new vistas in both analysis and writing style.[76] The most prominent history book during the tricinquantenaire celebrations was Étienne Charlier's *Aperçu sur la formation historique de la nation haïtienne* (1954).[77] This book drew most on Charlier's main inspiration: *The Black Jacobins*, espousing an explicitly Marxist viewpoint—a first in local Haitian historiography.[78]

Only shortly after the 1954 tricinquantenaire celebrations, Duvalier, who claimed to be Dessalines's political heir, became Haiti's head of state. François "Papa Doc" Duvalier's dictatorial regime (1957–71), followed by that of his son Jean-Claude "Baby Doc" Duvalier (1971–86), had a determining impact on Haitian historiography. Papa Doc Duvalier used propaganda to manipulate history writing; a negative type of rewriting, portraying Duvalier as Dessalines's ideological son through the repetition of the phrase "François Duvalier, the Renovator," ending the list of Haitian historical heroes. Many historians were silenced, and some of Duvalier's left-wing opponents were killed while others left for exile, and those at home were only rarely published. Propaganda also promoted Duvalier's history book *Le Problème des classes à travers l'histoire d'Haïti* (1959), with its *noiriste* racialist interpretation of "classes" in Haiti, diametrically contrasting with the Marxist approach of James's history.[79]

This book argues that James should be seen as an early contributor to a deconstructionist type of postcolonial historiography, which has become most associated in the context of the Haitian Revolution with Michel-Rolph Trouillot's *Silencing the Past*. In his compelling account of the silencing of the Haitian Revolution, Trouillot draws attention to the uneven power in the production of sources, archives, and narratives, highlighting the silences that enter the process of historical production at four crucial moments: moments of fact creation (making sources), moments of fact assembly (making archives), moments of fact retrieval (making narratives), and the moment of retrospective significance (making history in the final instance).[80] This unequal access to source making continues to this day, Trouillot argues, with unequal access to archives and hence to history making; so much so that

Trouillot refers to archives as "products/symbols of neo-colonial domination."[81] This book argues that James writes back to such silencing, disavowing, and misrepresenting of Haitian history.[82]

When faced with such silencing, misrepresentation, gaps, and blanks vis-à-vis Caribbean slavery and anticolonial slave resistance in the official historical and cultural records, one response could be to throw up one's hands like V. S. Naipaul, merely lamenting the void of Caribbean nonhistory.[83] Confronted with Caribbean history, the question James and others after him invariably grapple with is: How to unsilence the past? How to represent the unrepresentable: the horrors of the forced migration of the slave trade/Middle Passage, and plantation slavery? On the advantages of specifically literary resources for the rewriting of Caribbean history, the model proposed by Martiniquan writer Édouard Glissant's notion of *une vision prophétique du passé* (a prophetic vision of the past) is extremely useful, and this is elaborated around his sole historical play, *Monsieur Toussaint*, based on the Haitian Revolution after James and his *Black Jacobins*, which Glissant cites as his main inspiration.[84] Central to this future-oriented vision for rewriting the past is Glissant's idea that the historian must be seconded by the poet in the Caribbean in order to fill the considerable gaps specific to Caribbean history—the slave trade, Middle Passage, plantation slavery, anticolonial rebellion, and so on. Faced with the gaps of Caribbean history, and to link pasts, presents, and futures, James, like Glissant, turns to the resources of a specifically literary form: those of drama. One of drama's main features is its particular stress on the present. Drama's performance aspect will be seen to be a crucial tool for the long process of making *The Black Jacobins*, and for the active and transitive process of unsilencing the Caribbean past.

Rewriting history is a practice that is central to new ways of doing history pioneered by James in *The Black Jacobins*, such as the history-from-below perspective, many of which are deliberate reactions against the traditional paradigm of historical objectivity: Rankean history and Ranke's oft-quoted summary of the historian's task to tell the past "wie es eigentlich gewesen" (as it actually was).[85] "History from above" is an alternative applicable label for this approach that is distinct from history from below. This book argues that James, throughout his lifelong elaboration of his *Black Jacobins* project, becomes a key player in the move to reorient Caribbean, and particularly Haitian, revolution historiography toward history from below. Already in the 1930s, James envisioned black ex-slaves functioning as a Greek chorus in his 1936 *Toussaint Louverture* play, and his 1938 history already constitutes a

pioneering Marxist history from below *avant la lettre* of 1960s work by Albert Soboul, George Rudé, E. P. Thompson, Eric Hobsbawm, and others. Ideas previously pioneered by James in his 1930s work are crystallized, inspiring him to combine new from-below historical and political perspectives from the intervening period between the moments of his 1936 play and the 1967 play *The Black Jacobins*, applying them to new contexts. These include the influential history-from-below approaches of French and English Marxist historiography of the French Revolution and James's most important political theories, developed during his consequential political years in the United States (1940s–early 1950s), as part of the Johnson-Forest Tendency.

James's own role in pioneering historiographical approaches to history writing from below needs to be acknowledged. Most of all, the close family ties between his study and his mentee Carolyn Fick's groundbreaking history of Haiti from below need to be identified. Fick herself has revisited the 1973 origins of her 1990 study of the Haitian Revolution from below, and has outlined that her work bears the indelible stamp of James's "overpowering influence."[86] The story she tells of the making of her history illuminates the major roles played by her influential mentor James and his *Black Jacobins*. James it was, along with George Rudé, who first planted the seeds for her subsequent study on the Haitian Revolution. James and Rudé encouraged Fick from above to follow the lines of a more popular history of the Haitian Revolution. As Fick puts it, James had "left an indelible mark on the original conception and the eventual evolution."[87]

Fick admits that in 1973 she was "totally unaware" that James himself was "already thinking beyond the biographical analysis of Toussaint Louverture" toward an analysis focusing on "the revolutionary and creative power of untaught slaves," as indicated in his 1955 letter to Haitian historian Charlier.[88] Moreover, Fick reveals that had she known that James could have done the project himself, she would have been "terrified," and perhaps would never have agreed to undertake the new history from the bottom up. It is also informative to learn that James put his two mentees working toward an alternative historiography of the Haitian Revolution—Fick and Jean Fouchard—in touch with each other, leading Fouchard to direct Fick to her richest source for her research. Fick's study of the Haitian Revolution from below and Fouchard's focus on the Haitian maroons can be thought of as, at once, profoundly inspired by James's earlier *Black Jacobins* history, and as rewriting

and correcting it in their turn in line with new historiographical approaches from below.

On the question of leaders and masses in James's famous work, Fick's own assessment in the pages of her *The Making of Haiti* was:

> Although he was chiefly concerned in 1938 with the role of the leadership of the revolution, i.e. the black Jacobins and particularly Toussaint Louverture, the inarticulate masses are never lost from view, and though their activities are not always explicitly documented in the book, it is they, nonetheless, who provide the initiative and impetus, if not the driving force of any insurrectionary movement. So for the first time, the revolutionary potential of the masses is treated as an integral part of the revolutionary process, but again these masses, though vitally important, are not in themselves the direct subject of the book, chiefly concerned as it is with the problem of leadership and colonial struggle. And like Sannon's book, it is a study of the revolution through the historical biography of its greatest leader, Toussaint Louverture.[89]

Today, when James's *Black Jacobins* is discussed in conjunction with Fick's study, there remains a tendency to present these two works as almost diametrically opposed, as in Alyssa Goldstein Sepinwall's 2013 comment: "Yet where James suggested that the Revolution 'was almost entirely the work of a single man—Toussaint Louverture,' recent work has looked at the revolution more from below, tracing the efforts of multiple kinds of actors."[90]

What I am suggesting instead is that James's approach is less diametrically opposed to that of his mentees than previously assumed, including Carolyn Fick, Jean Fouchard, and their from-below historiographical approaches. From the beginning of the 1930s and through the 1950s–80s, James's retelling of the story of the Haitian Revolution should be recognized as the crucial precursor to historical approaches from below. It will be shown that James preempts pioneering studies of European crowds from below by Soboul, Rudé, Thompson, Hobsbawm, and others, taking them in new directions by widening the focus to Haitian revolutionary crowds, and from sansculottes, *bras-nus*, and *enragés* to the *menu peuple* mass of ordinary black ex-slaves.

Especially in the 1967 play *The Black Jacobins*, this crowd, representing the great mass of slaves, will be seen to function as a chorus, operating as an organizing tool for theater from below, as in the type of radical Marxist theater theorized by Augusto Boal.[91] And while it is certainly true that

The Black Jacobins history in both its 1938 and 1963 editions does continue to tell the story of the Haitian Revolution through the historical biography of its greatest leader, Toussaint Louverture, it will be demonstrated that as *The Black Jacobins* evolves, James increasingly points the way toward a type of history writing that would break the mold of political biography of great leaders. Instead, as he writes out the initial hero Toussaint Louverture, James will also be seen to write in more popular leaders, including Moïse and Samedi Smith. Yet James's *Black Jacobins* in all its forms is more than a history from below. Like other Marxist histories, it also illuminates the importance of crises in the ruling class and high politics, or history from above, and is best seen as a total history.

Chapter Outline

Chapter 1, "Toussaint Louverture Takes Center Stage: The 1930s," charts James's evolving interest in Toussaint Louverture and the Haitian Revolution from his earliest writings in a 1931 article on this subject up to the 1936 staging of his play *Toussaint Louverture*. Here the dialogic aspect of James's first 1931 Haitian Revolution–related intervention—"The Intelligence of the Negro: A Few Words with Dr. Harland"—is uncovered: a dialogic quality that will be shown to be boosted by James's turn to the theater in his first full-length Haitian Revolution–based work. Connections are found between James's vindicatory action-centered approach of making theater and doing politics. This chapter reflects on James's uses of drama as a different type of representing machine than fiction in order to bring protagonist Toussaint's biography to life. A relative chronology is proposed for all the *Toussaint Louverture* play scripts consulted, including one interesting set of shaky handwritten changes that begin to write in the character of Toussaint's adoptive nephew, Moïse. Analyzed here is the politicization of James's deployment of Toussaint with the past of the Haitian Revolution used for vindication purposes as a great success story and as a vehicle for propaganda. Collaboration with lead actor Paul Robeson is then explored as a crucial building block for the final shaping of the two 1936 *Toussaint Louverture* performances.

In chapter 2, "Making History: *The Black Jacobins* (1938)," the focus is entirely on the first edition of *The Black Jacobins* history to allow comparison with its predecessor, the 1936 *Toussaint Louverture* play, and to explore the advantages that telling the past as history brings to James the historian as he shapes his historical narrative line. Genealogies of *The Black Jacobins*

history are surveyed with special attention to French connections and collaborations with James's former protégé Eric Williams. An important section considers James's representation of Toussaint as icon and symbol in the 1938 history, and that of a larger cast of black Jacobins. The configuration of Toussaint's dialogic epistolary exchanges is demonstrated to be an important part of James's method. Challenging David Scott's interpretation that the 1938 history is not a tragic text, that text is shown to be already full of Toussaint's tragic flaws as contributing factors to his downfall. Finally, the first 1938 history edition's closing symbolism of defiant upright rebellious images is explored.

Chapter 3, "Rewriting History: *The Black Jacobins* (1963)," tracks the impact of changes made throughout the revised 1963 history. Revisions include fundamental changes to Marxist language and terminology, and the refiguring of leader Toussaint Louverture in the progressive metamorphosis of the text. On tragedy and *The Black Jacobins*, more is made of the fact that tragedy is a genre that pertains to the theater, and that the reader is encouraged to watch the protagonist's blunders and final catastrophe as they would watch a tragedy on stage or screen. The chapter assesses James's rethinking of sources, bibliography, and positioning of the mass of ex-slaves as a chorus. Additionally, the function of the most prominent 1963 change of all is analyzed: the addition of an appendix titled "From Toussaint Louverture to Fidel Castro." Important new directions sketched out in the 1963 changes are shown to reflect James's political evolution in the intervening years, especially his elaboration during his involvement with the Johnson-Forest Tendency (1940s–early 1950s) of his most significant political ideas, history-from-below perspectives, and the results of intensive study of dialectics, leaps, and speculative thought.

Chapter 4, "Reshaping the Past as Drama (1967)," turns to the remaking of *The Black Jacobins* as a second play. After establishing the relative chronology of all available play scripts for this 1967 version, using methodologies from genetic criticism and book history, this chapter considers the special resources of drama that are exploited by James to show the past of the Haitian Revolution. The main objective here is to give James his proper due for the important role he played in writing the play. How does James's rewriting of *The Black Jacobins* as a play in 1967 incorporate changes to the protagonists and alternative ways of doing history, Marxism, and drama? How is the relationship of the Haitian revolutionary leadership to the popular masses rethought? My reading of the play focuses on the epilogue, arguing that it constitutes a

unique crossover document between play and political speech, pamphlet, or interview. Ultimately, the epilogue is seen to change completely the key and register of the play's ending.

Chapter 5 is titled "Future Directions: Afterlives of *The Black Jacobins*" and maps out some of the work's impacts and afterlives after and beyond James's own rewriting of his Haitian Revolution–inspired material. My closing section addresses key translations, subsequent performances of the play, the impact of *The Black Jacobins* in Haiti itself, and monuments to James and his work, including the setting up of archives, libraries, institutes, and centers, all bearing his name.

A Note on Transcription Conventions

In terms of transcription conventions as applied in this book—especially in chapter 3—I use bold type to indicate James's own subsequent **additions** in a later draft or printed edition. Crossing out with strikethrough is used to signal his ~~deletions~~ of material. Otherwise, I follow James and his correspondents in their use of underline, italics, and all caps for emphasis.

NOTES

Introduction

1. See the image of this advertisement in Charles Forsdick and Christian Høgsbjerg, eds., *The Black Jacobins Reader* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2017), 15.
2. C. L. R. James, *The Life of Captain Cipriani* (Nelson: Coulton, 1932); C. L. R. James, *The Case for West Indian Self-Government* (London: Hogarth, 1933). See also Bridget Brereton, "Introduction," in C. L. R. James, *The Life of Captain Cipriani: An Account of British Government in the West Indies* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2014), 1–29.
3. C. L. R. James, *Mariners, Renegades, and Castaways: The Story of Herman Melville and the World We Live In* (1953; repr., Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2001). James discusses the rewriting in C. L. R. James to Hill and Wang, November 9, 1960, University of the West Indies "C. L. R. James Collection [Sc 82]" (henceforth UWI), Box 7, Folder 180. James later wrote that he was "rewriting *Mariners, Renegades and Castaways* to make it more suitable for general reading" (C. L. R. James to Hill and Wang, January 23, 1961, UWI Box 7, Folder 180).
4. C. L. R. James, *A History of Negro Revolt* (London: FACT, 1938); C. L. R. James, *A History of Pan-African Revolt* (Washington, DC: Drum and Spear Press, 1969).
5. "As Franco's Moors have once more proved." James, *A History of Negro Revolt* (1938), 13; removed from James, *A History of Pan-African Revolt* (1969), 11.
6. C. L. R. James, *World Revolution, 1917–1936: The Rise and Fall of the Communist International* (London: Secker and Warburg, 1937; repr., Westport, CT: Hyperion, 1973). It is not clear whether this was with James's permission or not, or what role he played in the publication process.
7. C. L. R. James, *State Capitalism and World Revolution*, 4th ed. (1950; Chicago: Kerr, 1986).
8. Daryl Cumber Dance, "Conversation with C. L. R. James" (1980), in *New World Adams: Conversations with Contemporary West Indian Writers* (Leeds: Peepal Tree, 1992), 119.
9. See Grace Lee Boggs, "C. L. R. James: Organizing in the U.S.A., 1938–1953," in *C. L. R. James: His Intellectual Legacies*, ed. Selwyn R. Cudjoe and William Cain (Amherst:

University of Massachusetts Press, 1995), 163–72; Grace Lee Boggs, *Living for Change: An Autobiography* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1998).

10. See Joe Kelleher, *Theatre and Politics* (Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 10.

11. On the multivoiced medium of drama, see Paul Breslin, "'The First Epic of the New World': But How Shall It Be Written," in *Tree of Liberty: Cultural Legacies of the Haitian Revolution in the Atlantic World*, ed. Dorris L. Garraway (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2008), 241.

12. David Scott, *Conscripts of Modernity: The Tragedy of Colonial Enlightenment* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004), 51; Charles Forsdick and Christian Høgsbjerg, "Introduction: Rethinking *The Black Jacobins*," in *The Black Jacobins Reader*, 1–52; Brett St Louis, *Rethinking Race, Politics, and Poetics: C. L. R. James's Critique of Modernity* (London: Routledge, 2007); Grant Farred, ed., *Rethinking C. L. R. James* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1996); Paul Buhle, "Rethinking the Rethinking," *C. L. R. James Journal* 6, no. 1 (1998): 61–71; Anthony Bogues, "Afterword," *Small Axe* 8 (2000): 113–17; Selwyn R. Cudjoe, "The Audacity of It All: C. L. R. James's Trinidadian Background," in Paget Henry and Paul Buhle, *C. L. R. James's Caribbean* (London: Macmillan Caribbean, 1992), 39–55; Selwyn R. Cudjoe, "C. L. R. James and the Trinidad and Tobago Intellectual Tradition, or, Not Learning Shakespeare under a Mango Tree," *New Left Review* 223 (1997): 114–25. See also Paul Buhle, "Afterword," in *C. L. R. James: The Artist as Revolutionary* (1988; repr., London: Verso, 2017), 174–211.

13. See Susan Gillman, "Black Jacobins and New World Mediterraneans," in *Surveying the American Tropics: A Literary Geography from New York to Rio*, ed. Maria Cristina Fumagalli, Peter Hulme, Owen Robinson, and Lesley Wylie (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2013), 174. Eric Williams, *From Columbus to Castro: The History of the Caribbean, 1492–1969* (London: André Deutsch, 1970).

14. The second play has been published as *The Black Jacobins* in C. L. R. James, *The C. L. R. James Reader*, ed. Anna Grimshaw (Oxford: Blackwell, 1992); "*The Black Jacobins*," in *A Time and a Season: Eight Caribbean Plays*, ed. Errol Hill (Port-of-Spain: University of the West Indies, Trinidad, Extramural Studies Unit, 1976), 382–450. Page references refer to the 1976 edition of the play. See Nicole King, *C. L. R. James and Creolization: Circles of Influence* (Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2001), 30–51; Nicole King, "C. L. R. James, Genre and Cultural Politics," in *Beyond Boundaries: C. L. R. James and Postnational Studies*, ed. Christopher Gair (London: Pluto, 2006), 13–38; Reinhard Sander, "C. L. R. James and the Haitian Revolution," *World Literature Written in English* 26, no. 2 (1986): 277–90; Reinhard Sander, *The Trinidad Awakening: West Indian Literature of the Nineteen-Thirties* (New York: Greenwood, 1988), 91–114; Frank Rosengarten, *Urbane Revolutionary: C. L. R. James and the Struggle for a New Society* (Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 2008), 220–32.

15. Other scholarship on C. L. R. James and *The Black Jacobins* that has been influential to this study include: Anthony Bogues, *Black Heretics, Black Prophets: Radical Politi-*

cal Intellectuals (New York: Routledge, 2003); Anthony Bogues, "*The Black Jacobins* and the Long Haitian Revolution: Archives, History, and the Writing of Revolution," in Forsdick and Høgsbjerg, *The Black Jacobins*, 197–214; Anthony Bogues, *Caliban's Freedom: The Early Political Thought of C. L. R. James* (London: Pluto, 1997); Brian Meeks, *Radical Caribbean: From Black Power to Abu Bakr* (Mona, Jamaica: University of the West Indies Press, 1996); Andrew Smith, *C. L. R. James and the Study of Culture* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010); Cedric J. Robinson, *Black Marxism: The Making of the Black Radical Tradition* (London: Zed, 1983).

16. C. L. R. James, *The Black Jacobins: Toussaint Louverture and the San Domingo Revolution* (London: Allison and Busby, 1980), vi.

17. Paula Morgan, qtd. in Kwynn Johnson, "Place as Palimpsest—*Yon kote tankou Palimpseste*," *Caribbean Quarterly* 63, nos. 2–3 (2017): 169–76. My understanding of palimpsests is influenced by Trinidadian artist Kwynn Johnson's exploration of place and meaning in contemporary Cap Haïtien through her physical and symbolic etchings of that landscape. Her 2017 visual artwork *Place as Palimpsest/Yon kote tankou Palimpseste* builds on the set she created, along with Carol Williams, for a 2004 staging of Derek Walcott's play *The Haitian Earth*. Johnson developed *Place as Palimpsest* as a storyboard of Walcott's play, which also speaks to other Haitian concerns, notably dictatorship and the twenty-first-century outbreak of cholera.

18. Gérard Genette, *Palimpsests: Literature in the Second Degree* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1997).

19. Gérard Genette, *Paratexts: Thresholds of Interpretation* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997).

20. I follow Richard Watts's skillful combination of Genette and postcolonial theory in his analysis of paratexts in Francophone postcolonial literature. Richard Watts, *Packaging Post/Coloniality: The Manufacture of Literary Identity in the Francophone World* (Lanham, MD: Lexington, 2005).

21. See, for example, Robert Fraser, *Book History through Postcolonial Eyes: Rewriting the Script* (London: Routledge, 2008); Sarah Brouillette, *Postcolonial Writers in the Global Literary Marketplace* (Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007); Graham Huggan, *The Postcolonial Exotic: Marketing the Margins* (London: Routledge, 2001); Watts, *Packaging Post/Coloniality*.

22. For criticisms of genetic criticism, see Marion Schmid, *Processes of Literary Creation: Flaubert and Proust* (Oxford: Legenda, 1998), 3n4, 23–27, 29; Dirk Van Hulle, *Manuscript Genetics, Joyce's Know-How, Beckett's Nohow* (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 2008), 9, 17, 29.

23. On genetic criticism, see William Kinderman and Joseph E. Jones, *Genetic Criticism and the Creative Process: Essays from Music, Literature, and Theater* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2009); Jed Deppman, Daniel Ferrer, and Michael Groden, *Genetic Criticism: Texts and Avant-Textes* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004); Van Hulle, *Manuscript Genetics*.

24. On genetic criticism and theater, see Almuth Grésillon, Marie-Madeleine Mervant-Roux, and Dominique Budor, eds., *Genèses théâtrales* (Paris: CNRS, 2010); Josette Féral, ed., "Genetics of Performance," special issue, *Theatre Research International* 33, no. 3 (2008); Nathalie Léger and Almuth Grésillon, eds., "Théâtre," special issue, *Genesis* 26 (2005).

25. Almuth Grésillon, *Éléments de critique génétique: Lire les manuscrits modernes* (Paris: Presses universitaires de France, 1994).

26. See, however, the issue of the journal *Genesis* that does look at the trajectory of rewriting after publication: Rudolf Mahrer, ed., "Après le texte: De la réécriture après publication," special issue, *Genesis* 44 (2017).

27. Claire Riffard and Daniel Delas, eds., "Afrique–Caraïbe," special issue, *Genesis* 33 (2011).

28. On theatrical genesis, see Grésillon, Mervant-Roux, and Budor, *Genèses théâtrales*.

29. UWI Box 9, Folder 228, 24; UWI Box 9, Folder 229.

30. William Gibson, *The Seesaw Log: A Chronicle of the Stage Production* (New York: Knopf, 1959).

31. Augusto Boal, *Theater of the Oppressed* (London: Pluto, 2008).

32. Boal, *Theater of the Oppressed*, 28.

33. Afterlife is a metaphorical notion used here to invoke the relations between the source text and its avatars. My work on the afterlives of *The Black Jacobins* builds on work by Terence Cave, Ann Rigney, Richard Scholar, and Anna Holland, among others, outlining critical methods for engaging with this usable metaphor of afterlives. See Terence Cave, *Mignon's Afterlives* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011); Ann Rigney, *The Afterlives of Walter Scott: Memory on the Move* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012); Anna Holland and Richard Scholar, eds., *Pre-Histories and Afterlives: Studies in Critical Method* (Oxford: Legenda, 2009). Useful for my purposes have also been Kristin Ross, *May '68 and Its Afterlives* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004); and Eric Hobsbawm, *Echoes of the Marseillaise: Two Centuries Look Back on the French Revolution* (London: Verso, 1990).

34. C. L. R. James, "Lectures on *The Black Jacobins*," *Small Axe* 8 (2000): 65–112.

35. See Brouillette, *Postcolonial Writers in the Global Literary Marketplace*, 11–12, 67–69, 104; Christopher Watkin, "Rewriting the Death of the Author: Rancièrian Reflections," *Philosophy and Literature* 39 (2015): 32–46; Seán Burke, *The Death and Return of the Author: Criticism and Subjectivity in Barthes, Foucault, and Derrida* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1992).

36. On the special qualities of theater as literature, see Raphael Samuel, "Introduction: Theatre and Politics," in *Theatres of the Left, 1880–1935: Workers' Theatre Movements in Britain and America*, ed. Raphael Samuel, Ewan MacColl, and Stuart Cosgrove (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1985), xiii; Kelleher, *Theatre and Politics*, 10, 13.

37. See C. L. R. James, *The Future in the Present: Selected Writings*, vol. 1 (London: Allison and Busby, 1977); Alun Munslow, *Narrative and History* (Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), 48.

38. On showing versus telling forms of historical representation, see Munslow, *Narrative and History*, 60.
39. See Hayden White, *The Content of the Form: Narrative Discourse and Historical Representation* (Baltimore, MD: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1987).
40. Kara M. Rabbitt, "C. L. R. James's Figuring of Toussaint Louverture: *The Black Jacobins* and the Literary Hero," in Cudjoe and Cain, *C. L. R. James*, 118–35; David Geggus, *Haitian Revolutionary Studies* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2002), 31.
41. On this literary feel, see King, *C. L. R. James and Creolization*; King, "C. L. R. James, Genre and Cultural Politics," 13–38.
42. C. L. R. James, *Beyond a Boundary* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2013), 121, 151.
43. Samuel, "Introduction," xiii; Kelleher, *Theatre and Politics*, 10, 13.
44. James, *The Black Jacobins* (1980), v.
45. Bernard Moitt, "Transcending Linguistic and Cultural Frontiers in Caribbean Historiography: C. L. R. James, French Sources, and Slavery in San Domingo," in Cudjoe and Cain, *C. L. R. James*, 136.
46. Thomas Madiou, *Histoire d'Haïti*, 2 vols. (Port-au-Prince: J. Courtois, 1847–48); Alexis Beaubrun Ardouin, *Études sur l'histoire d'Haïti, suivies de la vie du général J. M. Borgella*, 11 vols. (Paris: n.p., 1853–60; repr., Port-au-Prince: François Dalencourt, 1958).
47. Michel-Rolph Trouillot, "Haitian Historiography," in *General History of the Caribbean*, vol. 6, *Methodology and Historiography of the Caribbean*, ed. B. W. Higman (Paris: Unesco; London: Macmillan Education, 1999), 458.
48. C. L. R. James, *The Black Jacobins* (New York: Vintage, 1963), 387. References in this chapter are to the 1963 edition.
49. Michel Hector, "Pour un colloque sur l'enseignement de l'histoire en Haïti," *Revue de la Société haïtienne d'histoire et de géographie* 237 (2009): 47–60.
50. Trouillot, "Haitian Historiography," 462.
51. James himself used the historical term "mulatto" to refer to mixed-race black and white people throughout his writings.
52. See Geggus, *Haitian Revolutionary Studies*, 33.
53. Victor Schœlcher, *Vie de Toussaint Louverture* (1889; repr., Paris: Karthala, 1982).
54. Pamphile de Lacroix, *Mémoires pour servir à l'Histoire de la Révolution de Saint-Domingue* (Paris: Pillet aîné, 1819); Chris Bongie, "Introduction: Bug-Jargal, 1791: Language and History in Translation," in *Bug-Jargal*, trans. and ed. Chris Bongie (Ontario: Broadview, 2004), 9–47; Susan Gillman and Kirsten Silva Gruesz, "Worlding America: The Hemispheric Text-Network," in *The Blackwell Companion to American Literary Studies*, ed. Robert S. Levine and Caroline Levander (Oxford: Blackwell, 2011), 228–47.
55. Marlene L. Daut, *Tropics of Haiti: Race and the Literary History of the Haitian Revolution in the Atlantic World, 1789–1865* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2015), 522.

56. Nick Nesbitt, "Fragments of a Universal History: Global Capital, Mass Revolution, and the Idea of Equality in *The Black Jacobins*," in Forsdick and Høgsbjerg, *The Black Jacobins Reader*, 139–61.
57. See Alfred Auguste Nemours, *Histoire militaire de la guerre d'indépendance de Saint-Domingue*, 2 vols. (Paris: n.p., 1925); Alfred Auguste Nemours, *Histoire de la captivité et de la mort de Toussaint-Louverture* (Paris: n.p., 1929).
58. Trouillot, "Haitian Historiography," 461.
59. See Trouillot, "Haitian Historiography." Alfred Auguste Nemours, *Histoire de la famille et de la descendance de Toussaint-Louverture* (Port-au-Prince: Éditions Presses nationales d'Haïti, 2008).
60. Charles Forsdick, "The Black Jacobin in Paris," *Journal of Romance Studies* 5, no. 3 (2005): 17.
61. See Trouillot, "Haitian Historiography," 469.
62. Jean Fouchard, *Les Marrons de la liberté* (Paris: Éditions de l'École, 1972); C. L. R. James, "Preface," in Jean Fouchard, *The Haitian Maroons: Liberty or Death* (New York: Blyden, 1981), v–vii.
63. On the importance of these historiographical contributions by *The Black Jacobins*, see James, *The C. L. R. James Reader*, 5–7; VèVè A. Clark, "Haiti's Tragic Overture: (Mis)Representations of the Haitian Revolution in World Drama," in *Representing the French Revolution: Literature, Historiography, and Art*, ed. James A. W. Heffernan (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England), 239, 242.
64. See, for example, all the accolades for *The Black Jacobins* listed by Aldon Lynn Nielsen in his *C. L. R. James: A Critical Introduction* (Jackson: University Press of Mississippi, 1997), 52. According to Anna Grimshaw, this work "raised implicitly, a challenge to certain assumptions which were commonplace on the revolutionary Left. First of all, he cast doubt on the assumption that the revolution would take place first in Europe, and in the advanced capitalist countries, and that this would act as a model and a catalyst for the later upheavals in the underdeveloped world. Secondly, there were clear indications that the lack of specially-trained leaders, a vanguard, did not hold back the movement of the San Domingo revolution" (James, *The C. L. R. James Reader*, 7). Robert Hill's assessment is that *The Black Jacobins* "revolutionized historical writing in ways dealing both with conception and method"; Robert A. Hill, "In England, 1932–1938," in *C. L. R. James: His Life and Work*, ed. Paul Buhle (London: Allison and Busby, 1986), 79. Some associates of James have claimed, however, that such testimonies are overblown. See Farrukh Dhondy, *C. L. R. James* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 2001), 125–27, 163–66; Louise Cripps, *C. L. R. James: Memories and Commentaries* (London: Cornwall, 1997), 188–99.
65. Laurent Dubois, *Avengers of the New World: The Story of the Haitian Revolution* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2004), 298–99; Geggus, *Haitian Revolutionary Studies*, 207–15; Laurent Dubois and Julius Scott, eds., *Origins of the Black Atlantic: Rewriting Histories* (London: Routledge, 2010). Important studies of the Haitian Revolution and Toussaint Louverture include a graphic history by Rocky Cotard

and Laurent Dubois, "The Slave Revolution That Gave Birth to Haiti," *The Nib*, February 5, 2018, https://thenib.com/haitian-revolution; Jeremy Popkin, *A Concise History of Haiti* (Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell, 2011); John Garrigus, *Before Haiti: Race and Citizenship in French Saint-Domingue* (Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006); David P. Geggus, *The Impact of the Haitian Revolution in the Atlantic World* (Columbia: University of South Carolona Press, 2001); David B. Gaspar and David P. Geggus, eds., *A Turbulent Time: The French Revolution and the Greater Caribbean* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2002); David P. Geggus and Norman Fiering, eds., *The World of the Haitian Revolution* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2009); Deborah Jenson, *Beyond the Slave Narrative: Politics, Sex, and Manuscripts in the Haitian Revolution* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2011); Malick W. Ghachem, *The Old Regime and the Haitian Revolution* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012); Charles Forsdick and Christian Høgsbjerg, *Toussaint Louverture: A Black Jacobin in the Age of Revolutions* (London: Pluto, 2017).

66. On the corresponding onomastic revolution taking place in the French language in France in response to the French Revolution—involving new titles such as *citoyen*, new calendar months such as *pluviôse*, renumbering years starting with "An I" (Year I), and new place names such as the Champ de Mars, see Steven Blakemore, "Revolution in Language: Burke's Representation of Linguistic Terror," in Heffernan, *Representing the French Revolution*, 3–23; Ronald Paulson, *Representations of Revolution (1789–1820)* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1983), 15–19; and Keith Michael Baker, *Inventing the French Revolution: Essays on French Political Culture in the Eighteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 203–7.

67. See David Geggus, "The Naming of Haiti," *New West Indian Guide* 71 (1997): 43–68.

68. Regarding the French Revolution, Paulson observes: "In terms of language, revolution makes words mean something else. [. . .] To fit in with the change of events, words, too, had to change their usual meanings." Paulson, *Representations of Revolution*, 15.

69. Haitian Declaration of Independence, January 1, 1804, Duke University Libraries, Digital Collections, http://library.duke.edu/digitalcollections/rubenstein_hdimso1001/; Dubois, *Avengers of the New World*, 298; Laurent Dubois, *Haiti: The Aftershocks of History* (New York: Picador, 2012), 16.

70. Dubois, *Avengers of the New World*, 298; Geggus, *Haitian Revolutionary Studies*, 208. See also Louis Félix, *Mémoires pour servir à l'histoire d'Haïti* (Paris: n.p., 1851).

71. Marlene L. Daut, "Un-Silencing the Past: Boisrond-Tonnerre, Vastey, and the Rewriting of the Haitian Revolution," *South Atlantic Review* 74, no. 1 (2009): 35–64; Daut, *Tropics of Haiti*, 73–109.

72. Susan Buck-Morss, *Hegel, Haiti, and Universal History* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2009); Sibylle Fischer, *Modernity Disavowed: Haiti and the Cultures of Slavery in the Age of Revolution* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2004); Michel-Rolph Trouillot, *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History* (Boston: Beacon, 1995), 84, 88.

73. Nick Nesbitt, *Universal Emancipation: The Haitian Revolution and the Radical Enlightenment* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2008). As Dubois and Scott make clear, even Diderot's famous ghostwritten passage in the Abbé Reynal's multivolume history of European colonialism was written firmly from the present and reads more as "a call/warning." Laurent Dubois and Julius Scott, "An African Revolutionary in the Atlantic World," in *Revolution! The Atlantic World Reborn*, ed. Thomas Bender, Laurent Dubois, and Richard Rabionwitz (New York: New York Historical Society, 2011), 144.

74. Sylvia Wynter discusses the fundamental importance for Jamaica of becoming "the agent and creative *subject* of our [history]," instead of being "the *object* of the history of other nations." Sylvia Wynter, *Jamaica's National Heroes* (Kingston: Jamaica National Commission, 1971). See also Anthony Bogues, "History, Decolonization and the Making of Revolution: Reflections on Writing the Popular History of the Jamaican Events of 1938," *Interventions* 12, no. 1 (2010): 76–87.

75. Eric Williams, *Capitalism and Slavery* (1944; repr., Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1994).

76. Trouillot, "Haitian Historiography," 468.

77. Étienne Charlier, *Aperçu sur la formation historique de la nation haïtienne* (Port-au-Prince: Presses libres, 1954).

78. Trouillot, "Haitian Historiography," 469.

79. For ways in which François Duvalier imposed his history book, *Le Problème des classes à travers l'histoire d'Haïti*, 2nd ed. (Port-au-Prince: Au service de la jeunesse, 1959), during his dictatorship, see Hector, "Pour un colloque sur l'enseignement de l'histoire en Haïti," 47–60.

80. Trouillot, *Silencing the Past*, 26.

81. Trouillot, *Silencing the Past*, 105.

82. Fischer, *Modernity Disavowed*.

83. Naipaul claims that history "is built around achievement, and nothing was created in the West Indies." V. S. Naipaul, *The Middle Passage* (London: André Deutsch, 1961), 29.

84. Édouard Glissant, *Monsieur Toussaint* (Paris: Gallimard, 1961); Édouard Glissant, *Caribbean Discourse: Selected Essays*, trans. J. Michael Dash (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1989).

85. Leopold von Ranke, *Geschichten der romanischen und germanischen Völker von 1494 bis 1535* (Leipzig: Reimer, 1824).

86. Carolyn Fick, "C. L. R. James, *The Black Jacobins*, and *The Making of Haiti*," in Forsdick and Høgsbjerg, *The Black Jacobins Reader*, 60–69; Carolyn Fick, *The Making of Haiti: The Saint Domingue Revolution from Below* (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1990). Since 1990, Fick has revised and expanded her work in the 2013–2014 French-language editions of the book: Carolyn Fick, *Haïti, naissance d'une nation: La révolution de Saint-Domingue vue d'en bas*, trans. Frantz Voltaire (Rennes: Éditions Les Perséides, 2013; Montreal: Éditions du CIDIHCA, 2014). Frantz Voltaire, the Director of the Centre International de Documentation et d'Information Haïtienne, Caribée-

nne et Afro-canadienne, re-presents the book for new Francophone Haitian and Afro-Canadian readerships.

87. Fick, "Acknowledgements," in *The Making of Haiti*, xiv.

88. Fick, "C. L. R. James," 62, 64. C. L. R. James to Étienne Charlier, August 24, 1955, UWI Box 7, Folder 190.

89. Fick, *The Making of Haiti*, 4.

90. Alyssa Goldstein Sepinwall, *Haitian History: New Perspectives* (London: Routledge, 2013), 16.

91. Boal, *Theater of the Oppressed*.

1. Toussaint Louverture Takes Center Stage

1. C. L. R. James, "The Intelligence of the Negro: A Few Words with Dr. Harland," *The Beacon* 1, no. 5 (August 1931): 6–10; Sidney C. Harland, "Race Admixture," *The Beacon* 1, no. 4 (July 1931): 25–29.

2. C. L. R. James, *Toussaint Louverture: The Story of the Only Successful Slave Revolt in History: A Play in Three Acts*, ed. Christian Høgsbjerg (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2013), 54, 131. Further citations appear as page references in the text.

3. On *The Beacon*, see Brinsley Samaroo, "Introduction," in *The Beacon: Volumes I–IV, 1931–1939* (New York: Kraus, 1977), i–xiii; Reinhard Sander, "Introduction: *The Beacon* and the Emergence of West Indian Literature," in *The Beacon: Volumes I–IV, 1931–1939* (New York: Kraus, 1977), xv–xxv; Reinhard Sander, ed., *From Trinidad: An Anthology of Early West Indian Writing* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1978), 227–37.

4. See Edward Baugh, "The West Indian Writer and His Quarrel with History," *Tapia*, part 1 (February 20, 1977): 6–7; part 2 (February 27, 1977): 6–7, 11. Reprinted with minor editorial changes and corrections in *Small Axe* 38 (2012): 60–74. See also Alison Donnell, "All Friends Now? Critical Conversations, West Indian Literature, and 'The Quarrel with History,'" *Small Axe* 38 (2012): 75–85; Laurence A. Breiner, "Too Much History, or Not Enough," *Small Axe* 38 (2012): 86–98; Nadi Edwards, "Contexts, Criticism, and Quarrels: A Reflection on Edward Baugh's 'The West Indian Writer and His Quarrel with History,'" *Small Axe* 38 (2012): 99–107; and Edward Baugh, "Reflections on 'The Quarrel with History,'" *Small Axe* 38 (2012): 108–18. See also Laurent Dubois, "History's Quarrel: The Future of the Past in the French Caribbean," in *Beyond Fragmentation: Perspectives on Caribbean History*, ed. Juanita de Barros, Audra Diptee, and David V. Trotman (Princeton, NJ: Markus Wiener, 2006), 213–30.

5. T. Lothrop Stoddard, *The French Revolution in San Domingo* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1914); James Anthony Froude, *The English in the West Indies; or, The Bow of Ulysses* (London: Longmans, Green, 1888).

6. C. L. R. James, "The West Indian Intellectual," in J. J. Thomas, *Froudacity: West Indian Fables Explained* (London: New Beacon, 1969), 23–49. On Thomas, see Faith Smith, *Creole Recitations: John Jacob Thomas and Colonial Formation in the Late Nineteenth-Century Caribbean* (Charlottesville: University of Virginia Press, 2002). On Thomas's